DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 079 572 AC 014 511

AUTHOR Ohliger, John, Comp.; Rosenberg, Joel, Comp.
TITLE Compulsory Adult Education.
INSTITUTION Ohio State Univ., Columbus. Coll. of Education.
PUB DATE Jan 73
NOTE 41p.

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Adult Education; *Annotated Bibliographies; Career Education; Continuous Learning; *Educational Theories; Health Occupations Education; *Professional Continuing Education; *Seminars; Socialization

ABSTRACT

A preliminary bibliography for a seminar on compulsory adult education is presented. A total of 231 annotated entries are given. Entries are divided into four categories: (1) compulsory adult education in general; (2) concepts significant to adult education, including lifelong education, permanent education, the educative society, the knowledge society, the learning society, career education, recurrent education and socialization, and the deschooling views of Illich and his colleagues; (3) compulsory adult education for professionals (not confined to the health professions); and (4) compulsory adult education in the health professions. (CK)

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

U S DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

ED 079572

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
COLLEGE OF EDUCATION
1945 NORTH HIGH STREET
COLUMBUS, OHIO 43210

FACULTY OF SPECIAL SERVICES

(614) 422-6335

January 2, 1973

COMPULSORY ADULT EDUCATION

This preliminary bibliography for a seminar on compulsory (or mandatory) adult (or continuing) education was prepared by John Ohliger and Joel Rosenberg.

Note: Suggestions are requested for corrections and additions. Where quotations appear below, they are samples, but not necessarily representative samples of the works cited. They are mainly statements that we found provocative. Those items below which list "ED" numbers are available on microfiche in the ERIC collections of many libraries as listed in the monthly publication of the U.S. Office of Education called Research in Education. Our thanks to Mrs. Linda Drake of the OSU Mechanized Information Center for help in locating these and other items and to Vicki Anelick and Mary Vogel for the typing.

Table of Contents

Page 2 - Brief Description of Seminar

Page 3 - Part I: Compulsory Adult Education in General (Items #1 to 14)

Page 7 - Part II: Overarching Concepts Which Have Significant Implications for the Imposition of, or Freedom from, Compulsory Adult Education including: Lifelong Education, Permanent Education, the Educative Society, the Knowledge Society, the Learning Society, Career Education, Recurrent Education, Recurrent Socialization, and the Deschooling Society-Retooling Society Views of Ivan Illich and His Colleagues. (Items # 15 to 129)

Page 25 - Part III: Compulsory Adult Education for Professionals (Not Confined to the Health Professions). (Items #130 to 152)

Page 29 - Part IV: Compulsory Adult Education in the Health Professions. (Items #153 to 231)

AC014511

THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
COLLEGE OF EDUCATION
1945 NORTH HIGH STREET
COLUMBUS, OHIO 43210

FACULTY OF SPECIAL SERVICES (614) 422-6335

TO: Whom It May Concern
FROM: John Ohliger
RE: Topic for Seminar, Ed 925.33, Winter Quarter 1973 (Thursdays, 4-6:30pm, 3-5 hrs credit, limit 15, room to be announced-not as in Schedule, permission of instructor required, call me at 422-1585 or 299-6482)

--"Such rapid change permeates every sphere of human activity that we may anticipate the beginning of compulsory education for the middle-aged and elderly." Sir Leon Bagrit, British cybernetician.

--"Learning cannot be imposed." Pine and Horne, Adult Leadership.

--"Who knows - the middle-aged dropout may, within the next 20 years, find himself running from a truant officer." E. Weldon, US Office of Education.

--"The school-leaving age in developed nations outpaces the rise in life expectancy. The totally destructive and constantly progressive nature of obligatory instruction will fulfill its ultimate logic unless we begin to liberate ourselves right now from our pedagogical hubris, our belief than man can do what God cannot, namely manipulate others for their own salvation." Ivan Illich, author of Deschooling Society.

Graduate students from a variety of backgrounds and disciplines are welcome to participate in this seminar to explore the implications of mandatory continuing education as it becomes a reality for increasing numbers of the poor on welfare, health professionals, and many others. Many states have passed laws requiring health professionals to take courses to maintain license to practice. Some large cities now require illiterates on welfare to take adult basic education classes. Nixon's welfare proposal would require adult training for able bodied men (and some women) without jobs.

During this seminar emphasis will be placed on encouraging research, publication, and action on the issues surrounding this topic. The two dissertations now in progress in two different faculties will be studied. Ralph Tyler, who has been quoted by one of his colleagues as stating that mandatory adult education is absolutely inevitable for millions, will be invited to meet with us. We will examine the apparent paradox that some prominent educators favor loosening compulsory education for youth while tightening it for adults. The general philosophy of educational compulsion - legal, social, economic - for adults and youth; lifelong learning; lifelong schooling; the learning society; the role of mass media; permanent education; political, economic, social, and technological alternatives to a society which forces mandatory adult education; these are all potential areas for study. Preparation is possible for an international seminar on this topic tentatively planned for summer 1973 in Cuernavaca, Mexico. Background papers are now available.

PART I: COMPULSORY ADULT EDUCATION IN GENERAL

(See also Items # 29, 43, 63, 142, 148, 149, 160, 183, 195 in this bibliography.)

1. Back, Kurt W. Beyond Words: The Story of Sensitivity Training and the Encounter Movement. New York: Basic Books, 1972. Commissioned by the Russell Sage Foundation. "The third problem is the question of voluntary participation. Sensitivity training may not be as great a threat to mental health as it sometimes may appear, but it does have its difficulties, its record of breakdowns, and its adverse effects. The sensitivity training technique itself, by its neglect of privacy and even its hostility to it, by its ideal of self-revelation, by its stress on many activities a person would not want to do normally, is almost completely dependent on volunteer participation. Forced participation would not only vitiate the whole meaning of sensitivity training, but has other consequences for its effects as well....It is known, for instance, that many of the best documented instances of breakdown have occurred among people who apparently were successful executives whose company felt that they should be sensitivity trained....There is a thin dividing line between ordering a person to go, suggesting it, and the presence of a general belief in an organization that if the boss has gone and thinks it is a good idea, then maybe it would be a good thing for everybody in his organization to have this experience. Alfred Marrow pointed out that NTL (The National Training Laboratory for Group Development) existed on a relatively modest budget of $300,000 until, at his suggestion, the Presidents' Lab was started. Once the presidents of corporations became involved in sensitivity training (and in this way got the support of top management in many organizations), the budget of NTL increased tenfold. It is hardly likely that this increased participation occurred without any subtle exercise of power....We must consider encounter groups in the same light as any other experimentation with human subjects....The first principle (of the ethics of experimentation with human subjects) states that nobody should be forced to be an experimental subject. Correspondingly, we must ask whether everyone who participates in an encounter group does so voluntarily. In many cases, participants sign up individually for encounter groups from a variety of motives, so no problem arises. In other cases, however, an encounter group program is accepted by an entire business or school as a training procedure. This is done, for example, in some medical schools. Here we cannot speak of voluntary participation. Even if there is no formal requirement or direct order by the boss to participate, it is clear to many people that participation is preferred and can lead to great advantages for the participant within the organization. Even without any pressure from authority figures, simple group pressure might influence a person to attend an encounter group if most of his peers have done so. In none of these situations can we speak of voluntary participation. This problem is aggravated by the fact that many adverse effects of encounter groups are the result of defective screening. Some people will be threatened very much by procedures used in encounter groups; some may even go into these groups as a desperate last gamble before commitment to an institution or suicide....Even with the current limited knowledge, it may be possible to screen out people who obviously could be harmed. But this simple precaution, which is so seldom observed, is made more difficult to enforce if pressure of any kind brings whole groups involuntarily to an encounter. With volunteers it may be relatively easy to check on at least some morbid motivations. People who come under pressure are likely to include those for whom participation would be dangerous and who normally would have stayed away. Aside from simple moral reasons for condemning enforced participation, pressure to participate increases the dangers inherent in the technique."

2. Beckwith, Burnham Putnam. The Next 500 Years. New York: Exposition Press, 1967. "By 2400, over one third of the world of the world labor force will consist of professional workers (including executives), and on the average each will spend 10 to 20 percent of his working life taking additional professional courses. Similar but less extended vocational adult study will increasingly be required of skilled and semi-skilled workers....In sum, throughout the next 500 years all workers will spend more and more of their adult life

in vocational education classes."

3. Blakely, Robert and John Ohliger. Conversation on Mandatory Adult Education. Audiotape, one and a half hours, 1972. Blakely is Adjunct Associate Professor of Adult Education, Syracuse University; now conducting a federally supported study of continuing education for health professionals. Ohliger is Associate Professor of Adult Education, Ohio State University. Ohliger: "So-called compulsory education at every level is always contingency compulsion. No one can force a person literally to do anything. The childhood compulsory principle is that if you don't go to school your parents go to jail or the child is taken away or there's a fine...." Blakely: "The field of health...is the field where, I think, further than any other field this compulsory education - mandatory education - has gone. The exception is the military....Here is this person, and the most precious thing is not money, the most precious thing is time. If you throw onto this person the necessity, in order to get his license renewed, or his membership renewed, or something else, to waste 150 hours (in courses and meetings) that have no relevance to anything else, you see you've done worse than no good, you've done actual harm...." Ohliger: "You mentioned over the phone that Ralph Tyler regards these (compulsory adult courses) as inevitable." Blakely: "Yes." Ohliger: "And that he simply feels we have to live with them." Blakely: "...Ralph would say...this is the situation and therefore the thing to do is to have these courses which are compulsory be as good courses as possible. And I suppose that's the answer. It doesn't satisfy me...." Ohliger: "One of the things that I think a lot of adult educators are responsible for, including myself, is the failure to recognize that when you call, or when I call, for anything to be universal I am am calling for it to be compulsory." Blakely: "Yes, that's right." Ohliger: "In my own cramped philosophic terms I don't think I have a choice. When I call for a 'Learning Society' and say that all men will learn all their lives, in that context I'm saying some men are going to be forced to learn." Blakely. "Yes. There needs to be so much flexibility...." Ohliger: "You don't see any possibility of reversing this trend (toward compulsory adult education)?" Blakely: "No, I think the trend is got to be accepted and interpreted as intelligently as possible and guided as intelligently as possible." Ohliger: "I guess that's hard for me to accept."

4. Charters, Alexander, Project Director. Toward the Educative Society. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Publications in Continuing Education, 1971. Charters: "A major concern of Continuing Education is the encouragement of adults to learn....The task of the schools demands accomplishment in full recognition that learning situations for adults are not and probably cannot be mandated by law (compulsory school attendance); therefore methods of attraction and persuasion are required."

5. Jenkin, Sylvia L. "On Not Leaving It As It Is: A New Shape for Continuing Education," Continuing Education in New Zealand, (May 1972), Vol. IV, No. 1, pp. 5-12. "Make lifelong education compulsory. Liberal hands are raised in horror! 'Nobody is going to suggest a system of compulsory attendances at educational courses throughout life', says W.H. Elliot (see Item # 63 in this bibliography). With respect, that's exactly what I am going to do. Why must we assume that compulsory education will be totalitarian? John Stuart Mill did - and where would we be with child education if we had followed his principle that no form of education could be compulsory or State controlled? There is no need, in our society, to suppose we would lose our freedom or become totally indoctrinated and conforming."

6. Knowles, Malcolm. From a transcription of a videotape presentation to a conference on mass media in adult education held by UCLA Extension, March 23, 1970. "The first proposition I would like to make is that in the next decade or two, there will be such a tremendous expansion of adult educational activities that existing resources and facilities cannot possibly meet the need that will emerge. There isn't any question in my

mind that by 1980 it will be an accepted fact of life in culture that adults will attend educational institutions, engaging in educational activities, as it is now accepted that all children will engage in educational experiences. Adult education will become, I am very confident, as much a part of the day in day out existence of adults as it has been in the past generations for children."

7. Kuhlen, Raymond G. ed. Psychological Backgrounds of Adult Education. Chicago: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults, 1963. Intimates that adults might be made to pursue continuing education if certain social sanctions were altered: "The motivational tendencies of people are largely learned as a result of reward and punishment systems to which they are exposed during the course of early development, it is reasonable to expect that motives may be changed during adulthood if the individual is exposed to a new set of punishment and reward patterns."

8. Martin, Everett Dean. The Meaning of a Liberal Education. Garden City, New York: Garden City Publishing Co., 1926. After giving the example of a New England public school administrator who "in a burst of oratory proposed that adult education be made compulsory," Martin states: "There can be no quantity production of the things of the spirit."

9. Ohliger, John. "Lifelong Learning - Voluntary or Compulsory?" Adult Leadership, (Sept. 1968), p. 124. "Are we seeking a society where adult education, for all intents and purposes, would be as compulsory as is elementary and secondary education?...It seems to me that adult educators have taken the belief in 'lifelong learning' and, like the little boy, shot an arrow into the air, knowing not where it would fall. Perhaps it is time to stop and take a look at what we are doing to individuals before shooting off any more arrows." (Reprint available without charge by contacting the author at the address at the head of this bibliography.)

10. Ohliger, John. "Dialogue with Myself," Adult Leadership, (Feb. 1970), p. 250+. "If adult education becomes compulsory it will negate all the principles of learning established in the field so far. Such principles are based on the idea that learning is a voluntary act." (Reprint available without charge by contacting the author at the address at the head of this bibliography.)

11. Ohliger, John. "Adult Education: 1984," Adult Leadership, (Jan. 1971). "A child is born in the year 1984. He can never look forward to getting out of school. From the 'infant school' he starts attending at the age of six months to the 'geriatric learning center' he dies in, he finds himself going to school all his life 'for the good of society.'... When he does die, a minister eulogizes him over his grave....He points out that this man was very lucky, for he was born in 1984, the first year that the national 'Permanent School Law' was in effect. The minister extols the wisdom of the late President Spiro Agnew, who in the last year of his second term of office was able to get such a great law passed. 'And so we bid goodbye to this lucky man,' the minister chants,'firm in the conviction that he will go to heaven where he will attend a school for angels into eternity'." (Reprint available without charge by contacting the author at the address at the head of this bibliography.)

12. Ohliger, John and Colleen McCarthy. Lifelong Learning or Lifelong Schooling?: A Tentative View of the Ideas of Ivan Illich with a Quotational Bibliography. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Publications in Continuing Education and ERIC Clearninghouse on Adult Education, 1971. ED 049 398. 19 pages of text plus a 157 item bibliography. "We believe that the opportunity and the warning Illich brings us implies at least three tentative proposals for action by adult educators. First, we must oppose all trends toward imbedding adult education further into the structure of the schooling establishment....This means applying the hee-haw and the heave-ho to the growing trend toward extending the compulsory principle to adult education. This means recognizing how fatuous

are proposals for bribery or seduction (e.g. schemes to 'motivate' adults to attend classes) as a substitute for compulsion in adult education."

13. Osinski, Colleen McCarthy. Dissertation Proposal on Compulsory Adult Education. Unpublished dissertation proposal, Ohio State University, College of Education, Dec. 1970. 12 pages. (For availability write John Ohliger at the address at the head of this bibliography.) "Most of the aforementioned quotations suggest a prevailing consensus which not only views adult education as a voluntary activity but also rigorously supports the value that it should be voluntary. However, a review of the literature also suggests a subtle gravitation toward the acceptance of the concept, nebulous as it might be, of compulsory education for adults....A Typological Construct of Educational Imperatives: 1) Personal; 2) Consuetudinal; 3) Economic; 4) Legal; 5) Technological....Recommendations: 1) Call for another NORC (National Opinion Research Center) study; 2) Call to adult educators for shared discussion and study of issues; 3) Call for Resistance!"

14. Quie, Albert H. "The Challenge of Lifelong Learning," Adult Leadership, Vol. 21, No. 6, (Dec. 1972), pp. 182-184+. "It might be useful at this point to make at least a tentative distinction between 'education' and 'learning.' If we agree that learning takes place in a highly individualized and informal fashion from one's first day on earth to his last, then we have to think of education as those structured learning experiences which are initiated for a specific purpose. In this context, lifelong learning is not very revolutionary at all. Some might even say that learning takes place in spite of formal educational experience. Lifelong education, however, would be a more revolutionary concept. If some of our children thought they would never escape the classroom, we would have a genuine revolt on our hands. But no one is talking about sentencing individuals to a lifetime in the classroom. Rather we are talking about the need for many adults to 'step in' and 'step out' of structured learning experiences throughout their lives."

PART II: OVERARCHING CONCEPTS WHICH HAVE SIGNIFICANT IMPLICATIONS FOR THE IMPOSITION OF, OR FREEDOM FROM, COMPULSORY ADULT EDUCATION INCLUDING:

LIFELONG EDUCATION
PERMANENT EDUCATION
THE EDUCATIVE SOCIETY
THE KNOWLEDGE SOCIETY
THE LEARNING SOCIETY
CAREER EDUCATION
RECURRENT EDUCATION
RECURRENT SOCIALIZATION
THE DESCHOOLING SOCIETY-RETOOLING SOCIETY VIEWS OF IVAN ILLICH AND HIS COLLEAGUES

(See also Items #149 and 213 in this bibliography.)

15. Abdennebi, Azouz. "Vers d'Education Permanente," Tunis: Bibliotheque Nationale, 1968. 7 pages. (From bibliography on Education Permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

16. Adiseshiah, Malcolm S. The Call of Adult Education: Living to Learn Together, Learning to Live Together. 1968. ED 029 227. "Even those who have had the most sophisticated education must continue to learn. The alternative is obsolescence."

17. Adult Education and National Integration. 1970. ED 049 439. "Promotion through Adult Education: Making people understand the fundamental principles enshrined in the (Indian) Constitution. . . .Inculcating scientific attitude and rational approach to everything. . . .Promoting respect for law and order."

18. Agriculture: Revue mensuelle technique & economique. L'Agronome Face a L'Education Permanente. No. 313. Paris: CCP Ste. d'Editions des Ingenieurs Agricoles, 1968. pp. 205-240. (From bibliography on Education Permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

19. Allen, James E. Jr. The Educational Third Dimension. 1969. ED 034 931.

20. "Aspects actuels de la recherche dans le domaine de l'education des adultes, experiences et methodes du CIF., du Centre d'etudes sociologiques du CNRS, de l'INFA, du CUCES." Dossiers documentaires, serie Information No. 68. Nancy: Centre Universitaire de Cooperation Economique et Social, 1964. (From bibliography on Education Permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

21. Bell, Wilmer and others. "International Survey of Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. I, No. 4, (December, 1968), pp. 54-69. Survey of USA, Latin America (in Spanish), Ghana, Nigeria, Ivory Coast, Japan, Finland, India, & UNESCO. (Reports on the USA, Ghana, Nigeria, & Ivory Coast are from the WCOPT Education Panorama - see item #37 in this bibliography.)

22. Boeglen, L. An Analysis of general and technical education activities from the angle of permanent education. Strasbourg: Council of Europe, 1968. 31 pages. English and French. (From bibliography on Education Permanente, Convergence, December, 1968.)

23. Bonancina, Franco. L'Education Permanente en Italie. Motivations Sociologiques et Perspectives Culturelles. 1969. ED 039 434. Text in French only.

24. Capelle, Jean. The Development of Permanent Education in France. 1968. ED 038 592. "This vision, more poetic than scientific, would guide those responsible for future social conditions and especially educationists on the type of man that is needed for the society of tomorrow."

25. Charles University Faculty of Adult Education and Journalism, Czechoslovak Academy of Sciences, and Central Committee of the Socialist Academy. Report of a Colloquy on the Formation of a System of Lifelong Education in Czechoslovakia. Prague, 1968. (mimeographed). From summary in Convergence, (December, 1968), p. 88: "In Part I, this brief report touches on present problems of adult education in Czechoslovakia: decentralism versus super-departmental coordination; economic motivation versus humanistic goals."

26. Chenevier, J. "La Revolution de L'education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 56-59. Text in French only. From an English summary: "Clearly, the revolution of education permanente is inescapable, national in scope, and demands special cooperation between the worlds of work and education." A complete English translation is available on request from Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.

27. Chiasson, Beatrice. Les Besoins d'Education des Syndicats et l'Education Permanente. Serie Bleue: Cahier #2. Montreal: Universite de Montreal, Service d'education permanente, 1968. 107 pages. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

28. Conseil de la Cooperation Culturelle, Conseil de l'Europe. "Quelques Problemes D'Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (December, 1968), pp. 47-49. Text in French. From English summary: "Education permanente, considered as a coherently integrated system, must give to each individual the possibility of developing his personality during his work and leisure time. Thus the new concept implies (1) a lifelong education using orthodox and unorthodox methods, (2) the possibility of enlarging one's store of knowledge, (3) the possibility for everyone to take advantage of cultural opportunities."

29. Cotton, Webster E. On Behalf of Adult Education: A Historical Examination of the Supporting Literature. Brookline, Massachusetts: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults at Boston University, 1968. "Immediately following the First World War, the Adult Education Committee of the British Ministry of Reconstruction issued a classic report on the role and significance of adult education in a free society. The point of view which pervades The 1919 Report is best summed up in the following sentence: 'The necessary conclusion is that adult education must not be regarded as a luxury for a few exceptional persons here and there, nor as a thing which concerns only a short span of early manhood, but that adult education is a permanent national necessity, an inseparable aspect of citizenship, and therefore should be both universal and lifelong.' The combination of this point of view, the men who said it, and the national platform from which it was pronounced represent a landmark in the history of adult education. For the first time it was authoritatively and articulately stated that adult education is a permanent national necessity and therefore should be both universal and lifelong."

30. Council of Europe, "Notes of the Council of Europe on Permanent Education," Convergence, Vol. I, No. 4, (December, 1968), pp. 50-53. (Footnote: From "Case Studies on Permanent Education," France: Council of Europe, 1967). "The following definition was approved for adoption by the Council for Cultural Cooperation: The concept of permanent education as the organizing principle of all education implies a comprehensive, coherent, and integrated system designed to meet the educational and cultural aspirations of every person in accordance with his abilities. It is intended to enable everyone throughout his life, whether through his work or through his leisure acitivities, to develop his personality. It is also determined by the responsibilities which each individual has towards society. In order to cope with the continuous acceleration and change which characterizes scientific and economic development, it requires: (1) the spread of the educational process over the whole of the human life by making full use of the various existing and developing media and organizations; (2) facilities for permanent retraining and guidance both in vocational and creative activities and in everyday life; (3) possibilities for everyone to benefit from, and take an active part in, social and cultural development and cultural life. . . . .Education today still exists outside the modern technostructure of society. A new relation between education, industry, and political leadership has to be found. This can be facilitated if permanent education becomes a national concern. . . . Education is developing into the biggest national industry. The community, at all levels, must be allowed and, if need be, educated to participate. . . .The application of the concept of permanent education could lead - after the completion of basic education - to the introduction of sandwich systems in which periods of formal education alternate with periods of work life in an educationally conceived, interdependent process."

31. Council of Europe. Permanent Education. Strasbourg: Council of Europe, 1970. Includes chapters by H.H. Frese, J.A. Simpson, H. Jochner, L. Cros, and others.

32. Cros, Louis. Correspondence Tuition in France and the Development of Permanent Education. 1968. ED 038 597.

33. DeCrow, Roger. Ed. Growing Time: Selected Papers from the Michigan State Leadership Seminars. 1964. ED 031 662. Quotes Malcolm Knowles: "Society cannot continue with adults becoming obsolete. It has to prevent humanity from becoming obsolete. It has no choice."

34. Deleon, A. "Conception actuelle d'education permanente et de la planification." Peuple et Culture, No. 66. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

35. Drucker, Peter F. The Age of Discontinuity: Guidelines to Our Changing Society. New York: Harper & Row, 1969. "In a knowledge society, school and life can no longer be separate." The diploma curtain is seen as a problem, as is the prolongation of adolescence by the schools and the inherent conflict between extended schooling and continuing education. (Entry taken from Beyond the Carnegie Commission, see item #86 in this bibliography)

36. "Education and Culture." Review of the Council for Cultural Cooperation of the Council of Europe, and the European Cultural Foundation. Strasbourg: Council of Europe, 1968. English and French. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

37. "Education permanente," Education Panorama (WCOTP), X, No. 2, 1968. English and French. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

38. Education Permanente. Zurich: Federation suisse pour l'education des adultes. Trimestriel. French and German. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968).

39. Equal Educational Opportunity: A Statement of the Problem with Special Reference to Recurrent Education. 1971. ED 055 267. "Recurrent education is formal, and preferably full-time, education for adults who want to resume their education, interrupted earlier for a variety of reasons. . . .It constitutes a break with the institutional and pedagogical structures of present education."

40. Filipovic, Dragomir. "Permanent Education and Reform of the Educational System in Yugoslavia," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (December, 1968), pp. 42-46. "The concept of permanent education is not a new phenomenon in history. What is new is the fact that the modern world of constant and rapid changes cannot endure without permanent education. In Yugoslavia, permanent education has become the basic issue in the reform of the educational system. Permanent education is understood to be the education of every individual during his whole active life; in this sense, it is based on elementary schooling and can be extended and prolonged at any level. . . .The concept of permanent education entails an undreamt-of expansion of the educational system."

41. Finch, Robert H. Education for Tomorrow. 1969. ED 035 347. Address by the Secretary of H.E.W, to the National Industrial Conference Board: "Continuing Education is all this, and more. It is an attempt to integrate education into enriched experience throughout a lifetime."

42. Frese, H.H. Permanent Education in the Netherlands. 1970. ED 042 971. "Is the new (permanent) education meant to be a superior instrument for molding people in such a way as to make them conform to these developments?. . . .Its use will reinforce the established social order, rightly or wrongly, controlling and manipulating the destiny of whole populations."

43. Frese, Hermann H. "Permanent Education - Dream or Nightmare?" Education and Culture, No. 19, (Summer 1972), pp. 9-13. (published by Council of Europe, Strasbourg, France). "The situation becomes really serious when the new systems of permanent education, designed for use in free adult education, will be applied to compulsory education. . . .Like others I, too, was initially fascinated by the idea of an integrated system of educational provisions for life-long learning. The fascination has remained but I have come to distrust the centralization of power which the systems evidently display when they are left to develop on their own."

44. Furter, Pierre. "La Educacion Permanente Dentro de las Perspectivas del Desarrollo," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (December, 1968), pp. 22-30. Text in Spanish. From English summary: "This study defines continuing education as (1) a process of integral individual development; (2) a system of integral education; (3) a cultural strategy in a process of integral national development."

45. Gambacorta, Rocco and John Rosser. "Role of Adult/Continuing Education within the Concept of Career Education," 9 page typescript of material prepared for discussion at March 8-10, 1972 meeting of National Council of State Directors of Adult Education, New Orleans, Louisiana. "Career Education represents an educational commitment to the full employment ideal. . . .Career education is the responsibility of the school. . . . .The following suggestions related to career education are offered to decision makers in education:. . .5) Encourage the expansion of adult education to include more civic and social education. Career education is more than skills training . . .7) Provide leadership in the identification of solutions to cultural and social problems as well as work and manpower problems. . . .Career Education is closely associated with the life-long learning concept, and in order to fully realize Career Education, an adult should be recycled for a career at any time and almost any place. Along with skill training the adult must be able to meet his responsibilities as a parent, homemaker, and citizen and achieve self-actualization." Includes a 17 item bibliography.

46. Gueulette, David G. "Is There School after Death?" Adult Leadership, (September, 1972), p. 92. Condensed by the author from a longer 10 page typescript. For availability of the longer version write David Gueulette, 548 Stinchcomb Drive, Apt. 7, Columbus, Ohio 43202. "It seems to me most unusual that while some educators are calling for 'school for everyone all the time,' others are renouncing the value of schools for education at all. I am sure that I could never embrace a policy of education permanente or lifelong learning if it means lifelong schooling - especially when I hear some educational planners calling for 'super schools' that would rely on media, CAI, central control, a very bureaucratic administration, etc. With cable TV, such a 'super school' could even be had in the home for use at any time. . . .Adult educators, more than any, should realize that learning and schooling must be considered as distinct and possibly countervailing processes."

47. Hartung. H. Pour une education permanente. Paris: Editions Fayard, 1966. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

48. Hely, A.S.M. New Trends in Adult Education: from Elsinore to Montreal. Paris: UNESCO, 1963, (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, December, 1968)

49. Hely, A.S.M. "UNESCO and the Concept of 'Education Permanente'," Indian Journal of Adult Education, Vol. 28, No. 2, (December, 1967), pp. 7-12+.

50. Horn, Francis H. Tomorrow's Targets for University Adult Education. 1967. ED 019 536. "Every problem in society today requires expert advice, and the experts are in the colleges and universities. Those which are not there have been trained in the universities. To me, therefore, the task of higher education, especially of the universities, is nothing less than the salvation of society."

51. Husen, Torsten. "Lifelong Learning in the 'Educative Society,'" Convergence, Vol. I, No. 4, (December, 1968), pp. 12-21. "In the 'educative society' climbing up the social ladder depends very much on the opportunity and ability to climb up the educational ladder. . . .It will probably become normal in the future for the gainfully employed to take retraining not only once, but several times, during the course of their working careers."

52. Husen, Torsten. "Lifelong Learning in the 'Educative Society'," International Review of Applied Psychology, Vol. 17, No. 2, (1969), pp. 87-98. (Same as Item #51 ?)

53. Husen, Torsten. Present Trends and Future Developments in Education: A European Perspective. The Peter Sandiford Memorial Lectures. Toronto: The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Occasional Papers No. 8, 1971. 42 pages. "An astute and succinct overview of educational concerns at all levels, with concluding comments on the 'learning society' of the future," says the entry in Beyond the Carnegie Commission, see Item #86 in this bibliography.

54. Hutchins, Robert M. The Learning Society. New York: Praeger, 1968, paperback in Mentor, published by New American Library, New York, 1969. "Is it possible to. . .foresee the learning society? This would be one that, in addition to offering part-time adult education to every man and woman at every stage of grown-up life, had succeeded in transforming its values in such a way that learning, fulfillment, becoming human, had become its aims and all its institutions were directed to this end. This is what the Athenians did. . . .Machines can do for every modern man, what slavery did for the fortunate few in Athens. The vision of the learning society, or, as Sir Julian Huxley has put it, the fulfillment society, can be realized. A world community learning to be civilized, learning to be human, is at last a possibility. Education may come into its own."

55. Hutchins, Robert M. The Prospects for a Learning Society. Santa Barbara, California: Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, 1971. Audiotape #548, 25 minutes. "There is a fundamental, though not always sharp and clear, distinction between a learning society and a society in training. Learning, as I am using the word, aims at understanding, which is good in itself, and, hence, at nothing beyond itself. Training is instrumental. It may not require or lead to any understanding at all. It aims at the performance of prescribed tasks by prescribed methods. . . .Hence, the attraction of training to a man like the new US Commissioner of Education (Marland), who proposes, he says, to chloroform whatever there is of general education in the schools and replace it with something real, vital, and interesting, namely, vocational training. In an effort to make this more palatable he adds to the confusion by officially renaming 'vocational training ' He calls it 'career education.' Training will always be seductive, if only because it puts little strain on the mind of the student or the teacher. The trouble is, as Dewey pointed out, it's always obsolescent. And the rate of obsolescence is higher now than at any time in history. . . .The more technical a society is, the less technical its education has to be. . . .We must look forward to an immense - I apologize for these words, they're the only words I can think of - an immense decentralization, debureaucratization, deinstitutionalization of education if we are to have a learning society. . . .To attain full humanity is to reach the level of critical consciousness. This means understanding reality and understanding what men can and should do to transform it. The university is that institution which should lead in the achievement of critical consciousness. It must use and contain within it all the major modes of understanding and transforming reality. Thus, the university would represent and constitute the circle of knowledge in which everything is understood in the light of everything else. Such a university could preside over the progress of the learning society."

56. Hutchinson, E.M., Ed. Aims and Action in Adult Education, 1921-1971. London: National Institute of Adult Education, 1971. "In the changed circumstances of national life, there is a growing acceptance of the fact that new demands imposed on the adult population for improved techniques and for an open and resilient attitude of mind requires a continuing process of education." (From ERIC abstract - ED 057 327, document not reproduced in ERIC)

57. Illich, Ivan. Deschooling Society. New York: Harper and Row, 1971. "The school-leaving age in developed nations outpaces the rise in life expectancy. The two curves will intersect in a decade and create a problem for Jessica Mitford and professionals concerned with 'terminal education.' I am reminded of the late Middle Ages, when the demand for Church services outgrew a lifetime, and 'Purgatory' was created to purify souls under the pope's control before they could enter eternal peace. . . .No one completes school - yet. It never closes its doors on anyone without first offering him one more chance: at remedial, adult, and continuing education. . . .The ideology of obligatory schooling admits of no logical limits. . . .Our reliance on specialized, full-time instruction through school will now decrease, and we must find more ways to learn and teach: the educational quality of all institutions must increase again. But this is a very ambiguous forecast. It could mean that men in the modern city will be increasingly the victims of an effective process of total instruction and manipulation once they are deprived of even the tenuous pretence of critical independence which liberal schools now provide for at least some of their pupils. . . .Neither universal extended childhood nor the smothering atmosphere of the classroom could exist without schools. Yet schools, as compulsory channels for learning, could exist without either and be more repressive and destructive than anything we have come to know. . . .At some time during the last two generations a commitment to therapy triumphed in American culture, and teachers came to be regarded as the therapists all men need, if they wish to enjoy the equality and freedom with which, according to the Constitution, they were born. Now the teacher-therapists go on to propose life-long educational treatment as the next step. The style of this treatment is under discussion: Should it take the form of continued adult classroom attendence? Electronic ecstasy? Or periodic sensitivity sessions? All educators are ready to conspire to push out the walls of the classroom, with the goal of transforming the entire culture into a school. . . .The disestablishment of schools will inevitably happen - and it will happen surprisingly fast. It cannot be retarded very much longer, and it is hardly necessary to promote it vigorously, for this is being done now. What is worthwhile is to try to orient it in a hopeful direction, for it could take place in either of two diametrically opposed ways. The first would be the expansion of the mandate of the pedagogue and his increasing control over society even outside the school. With the best of intentions and simply by expanding the rhetoric now used in school, the present crisis in the schools could provide educators with an excuse to use all the networks of contemporary society to funnel their messages to us - for our own good. Deschooling, which we cannot stop, could mean the advent of a 'brave new world' dominated by well-intentioned administrators of programmed instruction. On the other hand, the growing awareness on the part of governments, as well as employers, taxpayers, enlightened pedagogues, and school administrators, that graded curricular teaching for certification has become harmful could offer large masses of people an extraordinary opportunity: that of preserving the right of equal access to the tools both of learning and of sharing with others what they know or believe. . . .If we do not challenge the assumption that valuable knowledge is a commodity which under certain circumstances may be forced into the consumer, society will be increasingly dominated by sinister pseudo schools and totalitarian managers of information. . . .Repression will be seen as a missionary effort to hasten the coming of the mechanical Messiah. . . .The totally destructive and constantly progressive nature of obligatory instruction will fulfill its ultimate logic unless we begin to liberate ourselves right now from our pedagogical hubris, our belief that man can do what God cannot, namely, manipulate others for their own salvation. . . .To deschool means to abolish the power of one person to oblige another person to attend a meeting. It also means recognizing the right of any person, of any age or sex, to call a meeting. This right has been drastically diminished by the institutionalization of meetings. 'Meeting' originally referred to the result of an individual's act of gathering. Now it refers to the institutional product of an agency."

58. Illich, Ivan. "The Alternative to Schooling," Saturday Review, (June 19, 1971), pp. 44-48+. "I believe that the disestablishment of the school has become inevitable and that this end of an illusion should fill us with hope. But I also believe that the end of the 'age of schooling' could usher in the epoch of the global schoolhouse that would be distinguishable only in name from a global madhouse or global prison in which education, correction, and adjustment become synonymous....Either we can work for fearsome and potent new educational devices that teach about a world which progressively becomes more opaque and forbidding for man, or we can set the conditions for a new era in which technology would be used to make society more simple and transparent, so that all men can once again know the facts and use the tools that shape their lives. In short, we can disestablish schools or we can deschool culture....The most sinister (of the educational reformers who accept the idea that schools have failed) are the new Masons of the Universe, who want to transform the entire world into one huge temple of learning....At present schools limit the teacher's competence to the classroom. They prevent him from claiming man's whole life as his domain. The demise of the school will remove this restriction and give a semblence of legitimacy to the life-long pedagogical invasion of everybody's privacy....For those who subscribe to the technocratic ethos, whatever is technically possible must be made available at least to a few whether they want it or not. Neither the privation nor the frustration of the majority counts....A teacher turns 'educator' when he adopts this technocratic ethos. He then acts as if education were a technological enterprise designed to make man fit into whatever environment the 'progress' of science creates. He seems blind to the evidence that constant obsolescence of all commodities comes at a high price: the mounting cost of training people to know about them. He seems to forget that the rising cost of tools is purchased at a high price in education: they decrease the labor intensity of the economy, make learning on the job impossible or, at best, a privilege for a few. All over the world the cost of educating men for society rises faster than the productivity of the entire economy, and fewer people have a sense of intelligent participation in the commonweal....Deschooling the culture and social structure requires the use of technology to make participatory politics possible. Only on the basis of a majority coalition can limits to secrecy and growing power be determined without dictatorship. We need a new environment in which growing up can be classless, or we will get a brave new world in which Big Brother educates us all."

59. Illich, Ivan. "After Deschooling, What?" Social Policy, (Sept-Oct, 1971), pp. 5-13. "We must choose between more efficient education of people fit for an increasingly efficient society and a new society in which education ceases to be the task of some special agency....If the school continues to lose its educational and political legitimacy, while knowledge is still conceived as a commodity, we will certainly face the emergence of a therapeutic Big Brother....Social control in an apparently deschooled society could be more subtle and more numbing than in the present society, in which many people at least experience a feeling of release on the last day of school. More intimate forms of manipulation are already common, as the amount learned through the media exceeds the amount learned through personal contact in and out of school. Learning from programmed information always hides reality behind a screen."

60. Illich, Ivan. Retooling Society. New York: Harper and Row, forthcoming in March 1973. From second draft: "A kakotopia could maintain the industrial age at the highest endurable level of output. Man would live in a plastic bubble that would protect his survival and make it increasingly worthless. Since man's tolerance would become the most serious limitation to growth, the alchemists's endeavor would be renewed: the attempt to produce a type of man fit for the still. A major function of engineering would become the psychogenetic tooling of man himself as a condition for further growth. People would be confined from birth to death in a worldwide schoolhouse, treated in a worldwide hospital, surrounded by television screens, and the man-made environment would be distinguishable in name only from a worldwide prison."

61. International Commission on the Development of Education. Learning to Be: The World of Education Today and Tomorrow. Paris and London: UNESCO/Harrap, 1972. 313 pages. From UNESCO Press, Special Article No. 3, (Sept. 1972). This is a "Blueprint for a Learning Society (in which an) International Commission on Education reports to UNESCO and forecasts the end of the school's age-old monopoly." The article attributes to the Commission the view that "real solutions to the problems of inequality can only be found in a sweeping reorganization on the lines of permanent, lifelong education for 'once education becomes continual, ideas as to what constitutes success and failure will change. An individual who fails at a given age and level in the course of his educational career will have other opportunities. He will no longer be relegated for life to the ghetto of his own failure.' The idea of lifelong education is not a new one but has been urged by educationists for some years. To the members of the Commission it is an observable fact: 'Human beings, consciously or not, keep on learning and training themselves throughout their lives, above all through the influence of their environment.' Recognition of this should bring revolutionary consequences.... If education spreads over the whole of life and concerns such a complexity of factors then it follows that the school 'will be less and less in a position to claim the educational functions in society as its specific prerogative. All sectors, public administration, industry, communications, transport - must take part in promoting education. Local and national communities are in themselves eminently educative institutions.' In the Commission's view, the trend must be towards the 'learning society'."

62. Janne, Henri. Permanent Education: An Agent of Change in the Present Education System. 1969. ED 038 600. "In my view, this evolution (of permanent education) will lead to the abolition of 'schools' - designed for specific age groups and organized in 'classes' according to the old school tradition - and their replacement by centers for the dissemination of knowledge and culture covering all age groups of the population."

63. Jessup, F.W. ed. Lifelong Learning: A Symposium on Continuing Education. New York: Pergamon Press, 1969. Jessup: "It is not quite unthinkable that some adult education might be made compulsory by the state - learning how to draw a bow or how to wear a gas-mask, perhaps - but the examples are sufficiently far-fetched to prove the rule that in a country which professes a liberal democratic way of life, adult education is, and must be, a voluntarily undertaken activity belonging to that segment of life in which man is autonomous." W.R. Elliott: "Nobody is going to suggest a system of compulsory attendance at educational courses lasting throughout life. It will always be open to adults to dissociate themselves from formal education and spend next to no time in further learning."

64. Jocher, Herbert. The Future Shape of Permanent Education. 1970. ED 042 970. "Standing still, lingering, resting and all forms of torpor bear the stamp of anarchy. Death is as it were the most complete form of anarchy....Education sets society moving and keeps it moving."

65. Jolicoeur, Fernand. "L'Ecole pour Tous dans le Contexte de l'Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (Dec. 1968), pp. 74-79. (Text in French only) From English summary: "Continuing education also implies a transformation of the present administrative structures."

66. Kidd, J. Roby. The Implications of Continuous Learning. Toronto: Gage, 1966. 122 pages. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

67. Kidd, J. Roby. "Editorial: Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (Dec. 1968), pp. iii-v. Introduction to Special Issue on Permanent Education. "It is not surprising that in the age in which have happened so many fantastic changes, compelling social and educational ideas are beginning to spread and may be taking root. One of them, perhaps the most comprehensive and most radical of all, is that of education permanente. It is not a new notion; it is as old as the human race, but it never was

taken seriously until the present. Even now its full meaning has not penetrated very far and its implications have not been grasped. What are the dimensions of the new idea? Has it substance or only shadow? For continuous learning there is a perpendicular dimension of learning continuing throughout the entire life-span, consonant with all of the divisions of education from nursery school to the post-Ph.D. level. There is a horizontal dimension of learning penetrating into every discipline, into every form of intellectual and spiritual activity known to man, and bursting through the artificial barriers erected between fields of study. There is a depth dimension of learning responding to simple needs on, up, and into the most agonizing, or most sublime search for truth....The concept has been given force and currency mainly in the past decade and particularly through the leadership of UNESCO, notably by the Director General himself, the Deputy Director, and A. Deleon, Director of the Dept. of Youth and Adult Education....Not much research has yet been recorded but, through the Council of Europe and in such institutions as the University of Nancy in France, significant work has begun."

68. Kyrasek, J. and J.V. Polisensky. "Comenius and All-Embracing Education," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (Dec. 1968), pp. 80-86. Quotes Comenius as writing "all mankind should become educated in all ages, orders, sexes, and nations" and believing that "such complete education for all people has to be served by a system of schools, the successive grades of which have to follow one after another....Comenius begins with the assumption that for men all life is a school. Of course, the individual needs different types of schools during his lifetime....Thus we can see in Comenius one of the precursors of adult education. He does not propose the creation of a whole net of institutions serving this purpose, but he is among the first to propose the ideal of a continuous education for all human life."

69. "Labor: The Worker's Woes," Newsweek, (Jan. 1, 1973), pp. 47-48. "According to the report, 'Work in America,' which was also prepared by the Upjohn Institute (for Employment Research) under a grant from the Dept. of HEW, an outright majority of Americans - including white-collar workers and even middle-level executives - are profoundly dissatisfied with their jobs. The problem, as the report sees it, is that workers' rising expectations have not been met in a job market that has remained largely static....The solution to this chaos, the study says, is the redesigning of work' to give the rank-and-filer a share in his company's decisions and profits. Furthermore, any worker who wants to improve his job or change careers should have access to a retraining program....The report has already raised hackles within the Nixon administration."

70. La Cultura Popolare, No. 1-2. On 8th National Congress of the Unione Italiana della Cultura Popolare e della Federazione Italiana delle Bibliotache Popolari. Italy: Unione Italiana della Cultura Popolare, 1968. Bimonthly. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

71. Lanteri-Laura, Georges. "Education permanente - Researches psychologiques," Strasbourg: Conseil de l' Europe, 1968. 22 pages. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

72. "La Place de l'education des parents dans l'education permanente," Paris: Document de la Federation internationale des ecoles de parents et d'educateurs, 1968. 18 pages plus annexes. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

73. Larson, Ulf. Permanent Education in Sweden. 1969. ED 038 595.

74. Learning Never Ends. Proceedings of the Second International Seminar on Workers and Adult Education. Isreal: Isreali National Commission for UNESCO, 1965. 199 pages. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

75. "L'Education permanente: tache du XXeme siecle," Numero special de la revue Vers la vie nouvelle, supplement au numero 65/9, 1968. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

76. Lengrand, Paul. "L'education permanente," Fiche technique. Paris: Peuple et Culture, 1966. 79 pages. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

77. Lengrand, Paul. "Pour une education permanente," Extrait de la revue International Review of Community Development, Nos. 17 & 18, 1967. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

78. Lengrand, Paul. "Trois Exemples D'Application du Concept D'Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (Dec. 1968), pp. 6-11. (Text in French only) From English summary: "Literacy, youth activities, and a new approach to educational planning are the three aspects of education permanente in which UNESCO is actively involved."

79. Lengrand, Paul. "Perspectives in Lifelong Education," Newsletter of National Council of Adult Education, New Zealand, Vol. 2, No. 7, (March 1970), pp. 16-27. "According to a second interpretation of lifelong education which is closer to the true nature of this concept, all educators and particularly those engaged in adult education must undertake a complete overhaul of all the different forms of education and training required by modern man in all different stages of his existence....Firstly, there can be no question of an age limit for education: education is a way of life, or rather a way of being aware of what is happening in the world....Secondly - and this is very important - the notions of failure and of success lose their significance....There are countless situations in which a man may succeed or fail, but the important thing is that he should have a positive approach to these situations, that he should be vigilant and enquiring, not a passive observer. Certainly, one cannot rule out all selection: industrial and commerical firms or administrative enterprises, for example, are not prepared to recruit staff on trust but demand certificates and diplomas. In actual fact, therefore, there is a contradiction which cannot be ignored between the development of lifelong education and the practical necessity for selection. But in the main this is not a problem for educators, but one which must be solved by employers who will have to find their own means of recruiting the men and women they need, on condition that this obligation for selection at a given moment does not have a backlash on general education, which is governed by other imperatives."

80. Lengrand, Paul. An Introduction to Lifelong Education. Paris: UNESCO, 1970. 99 pages. Abstracted in ERIC - ED 051 458 - but document not reproduced on microfiche.

81. Le Veugle, J. Initiation a l'education permanente. Toulouse: Editions Privat, 1968. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

82. Levine, Daniel U. and Robert J. Havighurst, eds. Farewell to Schools??? Worthington, Ohio: Charles Jones Pub. Co., 1971. Published under the auspices of the National Society for the Study of Education with contributions by Carl Bereiter, Amitai Etzioni, Paul Goodman, Maxine Greene, Robert J. Havighurst, Ivan Illich, Philip W. Jackson, John Ohliger, Everett Reimer, Mortimer Smith, and Peter H. Wagschal. Everett Reimer and Ivan Illich: "Much learning is unplanned. Learning directly from nature is unplanned unless the student is deliberately studying nature. Learning directly from the culture, unless it is research, is also unplanned. Not even all planned learning is education. Learning directed toward the performance of nonlearning tasks is better called training. Only planned learning which has future learning as its objective is education as we define it....In terms of the commonly held theories of learning, the role of the 'teacher' is to select the learning task, to select the appropriate reinforcement schedule, and to supervise the learning process. Since, however, the aim of education

is further learning the best education is that which maximizes lifetime learning. A program for lifetime learning can be written only piecemeal, and it appears, intuitively, that the later stages of an optimum program can only be written by the learner himself." Ohliger: "The key assumption I make...is that we are in the beginning stages of a vast revolutionary period. The outcome for the individual will either be a world friendly to freedom or a counterrevolutionary universal prison. Escalating frustrations, tensions, hypocrisies, and demands make 'muddling through' less and less practical....The choice is ours. We educators can play a part in the revolutionary leadership that will help nurture the power of the individual to really choose what, when, why, how, and if he will learn or not; or we can become the lackeys of the 'therapeutic Big Brother.' If we choose the humanistic path, we must have faith - 'faith in the educability of man' - and we must recognize that such faith, as it is fulfilled, will lead inevitably to other types of revolutionary change in political, economic, and other controlling power configurations."

83. Liveright, A.A. ed. The Concept of Lifelong Integrated Learning, "Education Permanente," and Some Implications for University Adul Education. 1968. ED 016 899. Prepared under the auspices of the International Congress of University Adult Education from a conference in August 1967.

84. Lorenzetto, Anna. "L'education pour le temps futur: l'education permanente," Article paru dans la brochure "Notes methodologiques" qui reproduit quelques extraits de Realta e Proble mi Dell'Educazione Degli Adulti, Rome, 1966. (from bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

85. Maheu, Rene. "Toward an Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 1, (1968). Text in French, but English translation available without charge from Convergence) Maheu is Director General of UNESCO. "It is only when adult education becomes for every man both a right and an urge, a duty and a source of pleasure, that it (education permanente) will at last become firmly rooted in the beliefs of the individual and appear as it really is: the most complete and concrete answer to man's material needs and spiritual aspirations."

86. Marien, Michael. Beyond the Carnegie Commission: A Policy Study Guide to Space/Time/Credit-Preference Higher Learning. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Research Corporation, 1972. Contains a 158 item annotated bibliography of suggested reading for post-secondary (including adult education) educational planning. "As a guide to further inquiry for the Carnegie Commission, various state bodies, and independent investigators, the following (five) recommendations are therefore made:...5. Alternative definitions of a 'Learning Society' should be seriously considered. In The Fourth Revolution, the Carnegie Commission exhuberantly suggests that the U.S. 'may be able to develop programs and techniques which can extend the advantages of greater learning to less wealthy nations...The whole world can be assisted to move faster into becoming a "Learning Society".' But, whether in reference to the U.S. or the global society, there are at least two ways to define a 'learning society': 1) a condition where a great portion of the population takes advantage of available programs, 2) a condition where a great portion of the population is continuously learning by any means. . . .As Harman notes, our society is at a crucial point in history when we can choose between, essentially, a second-phase industrial society and a person-centered society. Both societies could be justified as 'learning societies'."

87. McGhee, Paul. The Learning Society. Chicago: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults, 1959. 14 pp. mimeographed. (Speech by the late Dean of the General Education Division, New York University). "Questions in education now trumpeted through the land as of utmost importance will fade away in a very few years in the face of an inexorable pattern of living which requires an education more embracing than any yet known, for more people than ever before, and from cradle-to-the-grave. . . .Yes, there is some reason to think that we are developing a 'Learning Society'."

88. Miller, S.M. Breaking the Credentials Barrier. (Address delivered before the American Orthopsychiatric Association in Washington, D.C. on March 23, 1967, and reprinted by the Ford Foundation for which Miller is a program advisor in the National Affairs Division.) "Education and training will be increasingly a discontinous process for the highly educated in American society, as they will need new kinds of education at various points in their careers. The same attitude should prevail towards those who have not successfully weathered the educational system to high school or college graduation or beyond. They should be in practice re-entering and benefitting from education and training at various points in their lives."

89. National Advisory Council on Adult Education. "Career Renewal for Adults through Education," 12 page typescript. Document marked: "Draft for Discussion Purposes Only. Drafted as a working document on January 21, 1972 during the winter meeting held in Washington, D.C." Deals with Career Education and the U.S. Office of Education views on it. The NACAE is located at 7th & D Streets, S.W. Rob 3, Rm 5717, Washington, D.C. 20202.

90. Neff, Monroe C. "Continuing Education Is Career Education," Position paper, 8 page typescript, (Jan. 28, 1972). "In summary, career education for adults can be the vehicle which opens the door to opportunity for a large percentage of our population if it is properly conceived and structured. At minimum, it must provide the following: Adequate funding; Adequate leadership; Continuing education, a significant and major component; A curriculum with sufficient scope; Flexibility to meet changing needs."

91. Ogunsbiye, Ayo. Considerations on the Development of Permanent Education. 1968. ED 024 868.

92. Ommen, L.B. van. Beschouwingen Over Permanente Education. Staatsuitgeverij: The Hague, 1969.

93. Pagney, Bernard. "L'enseignement par correspondance et l'education permanente," Convergence, Vol. 5, No. 2, (1972), pp 43-50. (Text in French only)

94. Palme, Olof. "Are Young People Getting Too Much Education?" Convergence, Vol. 4, No. 3, (1971), pp. 3-6. Palme is Prime Minister of Sweden. "a hypothesis, representing an extreme - that all postsecondary education is organized on a recurring basis; that all people, after completing upper secondary education, go out and get a job; that after some time at work they take another period of education; that they return to a job; and that they then pass through another period of education; and so on."

95. "Plan national d'education permanente," Strasbourg: Conseil de l'Europe, 1968. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

96. Pongrac, Silvije. "Permanent Education of Experts in Yugoslavia," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 60-65. "The era in which education and professional knowledge were considered privileges is being replaced by the time in which they have become necessities. The level of education is being linked with the problems of personal, national, and social existence, as well as with the progress of the whole community. It seemed, at the beginning, that the acquiring of professional status was a goal in itself. Now, it is clear that this is only a point in the professional development of a person, so that it becomes the first phase in the development of a profession. In Yugoslavia, both processes are taking place."

97. Rasmussen, Werner. The Concept of Permanent Education and Its Application in Denmark. 1968. ED 029 178. According to a summary in Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 4, (Dec. 1968), p. 87, one of the author's four main points for a master plan of permanent education is: "Reorganization of all levels of educational administration: Local authorities in Denmark often hamper progress in their efforts to save money. 'Compulsory education' must be interpreted as an obligation of quality and this should be reflected in legislation on education as well as in levels of administration."

98. Reinhart, Bruce. "Nature and Characteristics of Emerging Career Education Curriculum," 29 page typescript of talk delivered to National Conference on Career Education for Deans of Colleges of Education, April 24-26, 1972. "Whatever else it is, the emerging careers curriculum is a socially and politically conservative phenomenon which affirms the role of social maintenance of the public schools. . . .The U.S. Commissioner of Education, Sidney P. Marland, Jr., has made career education the major goal of the Office of Education and career educators are seriously attempting to install it in public schools." Reinhart is Research Specialist, The Center for Vocational and Technical Education, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio 43210.

99. Report of the First Session of the International Committee for Out-of-School Education. Paris: UNESCO, 1968. 29 pages. English and French. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

100. Report of the Third Session of the International Committee for Adult Education. Paris: UNESCO, 1966. 14 pages plus annexes. English and French. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

101. Rivera, William M. "Futures": A New and Needed Literature for National and International Planning in Continuing Education. 1971. ED 051 478. "Democratization of school education is not a panacea but a Pandora's box."

102. Rivera, William M. "Recurrent Socialization": A New View of "Adult" and "Education" in the Life-Long Education Concept. 1971. ED 051 476. "It is felt that an important role for adult education - that of resocialization - has been ignored. . . . .Resocialization is a process in which allegiences, perceptions, and habits are altered. It involves a change in personal and social identity."

103. "Role et responsabilite des enseignements superieurs en matiere d'education permanente," Propositions au Colloque national de Caen. Paris: l'Association d'etude pour l'expansion de la recherche scientifique, 1966. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

104. Round-Table Discussion on Lifelong Integrated Education. Report. Manila: UNESCO National Commission of the Phillippines, 1968. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

105. Sandow, Stúart A. Career Obsolescence and Social Security: Emerging Education Policy Issues in Law. 1971. ED 061 903. "Seventy percent of respondents see the emergence of the concept of 'lifelong education as a right,' as the primary implication for the future." One comment: "It will force the government to face the reality that higher education is becoming less place and time centered and more an integral part of life itself. Entry, exit, and re-entry are going to be necessary throughout the life-span."

106. Schwartz, Bertrand. "Education Permanente," Journal of the International Congress of University Adult Education, Vol. V, No. 1, (Jan. 1966), pp. 26-48). (Text in French only.)

107. Schwartz, Bertrand. Reflexions Sur le Development de L'Education Permanente. 1967. ED 019 557. (Text in French only) Also in Journal of International Congress of University Adult Education, Vol VI, No. 1, (June 1967), pp. 7-36. (also in French only)

108. Schwartz, Bertrand. "Reflexions sur l'education permanente." Nancy, France: Centre Universtaire de Cooperation Economique et Sociale, 1967. 31 pages. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

109. Schwartz, Bertrand, A Prospective View of Permanent Education. 1969. ED 038 603. "The school, in the sense of the overall education system, will have to be for everybody both the means and the place of access to a critical understanding, and hence to the discussion, of culture and social life, as well as to training for an occupation."

110. Schwartz, Bertrand. "Permanent Education in Europe: How to Make a Start?" Education and Culture, No. 19. (Summer 1972), pp. 24-27.

111. Schwartz, Eugene S. Overskill: The Decline of Technology in Modern Civilization. New York: Ballentine Books, 1971 (paperback, hardbound published by Quandrangle Books, Inc.) "The thesis of the book is suggested in the introductory chapter: the crises that threaten human survival are inherent in science and technology and are not amenable to rectification by more science and technology. . . .Is there hope? Perhaps - if we can achieve an inefficient society that is man-oriented, not machine-oriented. The philosophical underpinnings of such a society. . . .are based on eight principles which are value-oriented and derived from moral and ethical considerations of man: (1) Man is within nature, a part of the mystery of life; (2) There are infinite paths to the apprehension of reality; (3) The inefficient society is a humane society; (4) The achievement of asymptotes is the first step toward the inefficient society; (5) In labor man creates himself; (6) The machine must be made subservient to man; (7) The post-technological society must be free and open; (8) The paths to the future are varied and infinite." The author was until recently Senior Scientist specializing in computer and information sciences at the Illinois Institute of Technology.

112. Seifert Eduard. "Sonderdruck aus Horizonte Osterreichischer Erwachsenenbildung." Verlag "Neue Volksbildung" "Schriften zur Volksbildung" des Bundesministerium fur Unterricht. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

113. Sevigny, Robert. "Etude sur l'education permanente." Rapport. Montreal: Service d'Education des Adultes de la Commission des Ecoles Catholiques de Montreal, 1966, 126 pages. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

114. Sheats, Paul. "New Knowledge for What?" Adult Leadership, (Jan., 1963) "Conceivably, we have now within our grasp a new kind of society - 'a learning society' made up of educative communities in which we can accelerate not only the discovery of new knowledge but its application to the betterment of the human condition. In this view, life is learning, the national dialogue will continue, and the search for truth hammered out in the crossfire of free discussion and debate, will go forward. To these ends, our joint efforts must be dedicated."

115. Sheats, Paul. The Case Against the Adult Drop Out. Chicago: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults, 1965. "The provocative question today is not whether we need continuing education - It is what are we going to do with those who refuse it."

116. Simpson, J.A. Permanent Education in England and Wales. 1969. ED 038 593. "The Ministry responsible for education . . .should also be empowered to establish influential liaison with any other government department which could affect education; and with any private or commercial provider of cultural and recreative facilities and with any body, public or private, that could significantly affect education."

117. Stein, Bruno and S.M. Miller. Recurrent Education: An Alternative System. 27 page typescript. (August 1971). (For information on availability write S.M. Miller, Professor of Education and Sociology, New York University, One Washington Mews, New York, N.Y. 10003.) "Adult education and training is usually viewed as a one-shot corrective for some particular problem rather than as a process that can be repeated as someone develops and encounters new opportunities as well as new needs. . .The existing delivery system in adult education is hopelessly chaotic. . .The term recurrent education can be used to denote a system that makes education and training available, in various doses, to individuals over their life times. The concept, developed in Sweden and refined by the Center for Educational Reform and Innovation of the Organization for European Cooperational Development, presents an alternative to conventional education. On the one hand, it treats adult education as a system of services that provides a variety of educational paths. On the other hand, it differs from the usual concept of adult education in that it treats the education of an individual as a process that is not necessarily completed during youth but may recur during the person's life."

118. Tavola Rotondo sulla nozione di educazione permanente e sulle raccommandazioni dell'UNESCO per la sua azione futura. Milano: Societa Umanitaria, 1968. 68 pages, mimeographed. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

119. Thomas, Alan. "The Learning Society," Food for Thought (Canada), Vol. 21 (8), (Nov. 1961). From ERIC abstract (ED 012 433, but document not reproduced in microfiche): "Demands that concern for continuous learning be a central factor in (Canadian) national policy."

120. Thomas, Alan M. A Brief on the Concept of Continuing Education. 1970. ED 045 902. "A person who has done well in the formal system gets the major chances in the adult system, the 'failure' finds little help in either. . .Once Western societies harnessed their economic and social systems to science and technology, with the dependence on material change implied, the need to extend such systems of continuous learning to the entire population has become startingly evident."

121. Tollett, Kenneth, Robert M. Hutchins, and others. Adolescence Is No Time for School. Santa Barbara, California: Center for Study of Democratic Institutions, 1970. 29 minute audio-tape. Robert M. Hutchins, Chairman, Fund for the Republic: "Nicholas Murray Butler (late President, Columbia University) and Will Ogburn (late Sociologist) both said almost simultaneously fifty years ago that the explostion of information was such that we were going to have to prolong adolescence at least until age forty-five in order to get it all into our students." John Wilkenson, philosopher and physicist; "One could contest this idea that there has been this explosion of information. In fact, most of the scientists who were here at the Center for the ecology conference were of the impression that there hadn't been an explosion of information, there had been an explosion of data. . .There has been a great deal of simplification. Astronomers can now operate with a few equations."

122. UNESCO. "International Conference on Educational Planning: Draft Final Report." ED/ICEP/5 (prov.) Paris: UNESCO, 1968. 17 pages, mimeographed. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

123. Venn, Grant. Educational Implications of Technical Change. 1963. ED 020 060 The former Head of Vocational Education for the U.S. Office of Education says (among other things) that "Education must accept the responsibility of entry job placement or educational re-assignment for every student."

124. Wheeler, Harvey. The Politics of Revolution. Berkeley: The Glendessary Press, 1971. 305 pages. Notes that the era of the "Learning Society" is technologically possible today. Dangers are noted, however, and the book concludes with a discussion of "The Manipulative Spector," as contrasted with the prospects for "A New Age of Wisdom." (Entry taken from bibliography in Beyond the Carnegie Commission, see item #86 in this bibliography.)

125. W.H.O. Chronicle, Vol. 22, No. 8. Geneva: World Health Organization, 1968. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

126. Wilhelmsen, Leif J. "Cultural Activities in Lifelong Education," Convergence, Vol. I, No. 4, (Dec. 1968), pp. 36-41. "One of the chief aspects of lifelong education is the realization that a good deal of our newly won leisure will not remain leisure at all, because our society makes it increasingly necessary for everyone to continue throughout his working life to qualify for work in a rapidly changing society. He who neglects to do this may find he is no longer employable in industry. We can see the outlines of a society in which everybody has the same possibilities of climbing the social ladder and of reaching the top, but in which the price to be paid is the continuous accumulation of knowledge, and in which he who concentrates on climbing to the exclusion of everything else is most likely to reap the greatest material rewards. . .The perspectives created by 'lifelong education' do not indicate a society where leisure is a problem, but the new prospect, a competition society where more and more time must be spent on vocational training is hardly more attractive to the idealistic educator."

127. Williams, David. "Adult Needs Today: The Fruits of Neglect," Adult Education, (Fall 1971). "What Freire has labeled 'the banking concept of education' - students as depositories, teachers as depositors - seems to be becoming education's primary mission, couched in what Allen has called the Myth of Original Stupidity: people are stupid until teachers make them smart. Consider Blakely's statement on the problems of professionalizing adult education: 'The needy are those whom we least know how to teach and who least know how to learn.' How can anyone not suffering from severe mental disorders escape learning? There is awesome potential in this

127. (continued) logic for turning education into the habitual denial of individualism and for redefining freedom, in Hardin's words, as the recognition of the necessity of 'mutual coercion mutually agreed upon.' Is adult education to be another means to technological panic all in the name of 'the rapidly changing nature of modern life'?"

128. Williams, David. "The Spectre of Permanent Schooling," 19 page typescript of talk delivered at Hamma School of Theology, Springfield, Ohio, in a conference on Ivan Illich and Paulo Freire, Dec. 2, 1972. For availability write Williams at 1891B North Fourth Street, Columbus, Ohio 43201. "The enthusiasm with which political and educational leaders have begun to embrace the concept of permanent education and its American counterpart, career education, is reason enough to suspect the motivations toward life-long schooling. . .It is a rarity indeed to find politics and education so openly aligned, and amid the incantations that permanent schooling is the new way to the better future and Presidential (Nixon) cajoling that career education is the path to 'genuine reform in the way we teach,' our eyes are best directed at the image of the world these'reforms' demand, and the alternatives at hand. . .The emergence of permanent education from the former theories of lifelong learning is matched by career education's conceptual exodus from America's vocational education movement. . .We can now know that educational alternatives must adopt a larger scope, requiring both an acknowledgement of the dynamic interconnectedness of education with political and economic forms of control, and the admission to ourselves that change in one realm is unlikely in the absence of changes in the others. Our future work then is multifaceted, mandating us to act as much as political revolutionaires as professional educators. And that may be necessary just to maintain a hold on what ground we now occupy."

129. Workers in Adult Education. Series "Education in Europe." Strasbourg: Council for Cultural Cooperation, Council of Europe, 1966. 107 pages. (From bibliography on education permanente, Convergence, Dec. 1968)

PART III: COMPULSORY ADULT EDUCATION FOR PROFESSIONALS (NOT CONFINED TO THE HEALTH PROFESSIONS)

(See also Items # 1, 2, 3, 18, 50, 96, 158, 192 in this bibliography.)

130. Barrett, Gerald V., and others. Combatting Obsolescence Using Perceived Discrepancies in Job Expectations of Research Managers and Scientists. Rochester, N.Y.: Rochester University, Management Research Center, 1970. 28 pages, preliminary report. From ERIC abstract (ED 047 250, but document not reproduced on microfiche): "The 'Exercise Future' questionnaire, which covers individual preferences and expectations about conditions on one's work, were completed by 143 research and development scientists, engineers, and managers....75 % saw the imperative of educational upgrading, but only 44 % expected to have time allocated for their own development....Freedom from organizational constraints was important, but few expected to achieve such freedom to select new projects or set schedules for themselves."

131. Bell, Terrel H. On Being Educated in 1991. 1970. ED 045 006. The Acting U.S. Commissioner of Education says that education is not over at the diploma stage, because the price of survival in this society is life-long learning and that each person should develop a plan for life-long learning about the world he lives in before he leaves college.

132. Buchanan, Derek J. "Professional Attitudes to Continuing Education in England," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 51-55. "Of course the central difficulty of in-service education is not the provision of courses or the standards of learning aids, but the profound unconcern of most mature people for any offers of further education. Indeed, the mass of members value their professional body only for the prestige it brings to them. This may be the stick with which to threaten them. For some years, the idea of obsolescent degrees, requiring 'topping up,' has been discussed regularly. Doctors working for the National Health Service are promoted to seniority rates of pay only after having attended a number of courses approved by the ministry. The Secretary of the Institution of Structural Engineers hinted at this prospect when he said, 'We shall need (a little more time) before specifying the kind of mid-career up-dating that will become necessary for future continuing membership in the Institution'."

133. Charters, Alexander. "Continuing Education for the Professions," Chapter in Smith, Aker, & Kidd, eds. Handbook of Adult Education. New York: Macmillan Co., 1970. "Some issues:...Should a professional be required to continue his education in order for a license or certificate to remain valid? At one time the license to drive a motor vehicle was valid for life. Now one must meet certain requirements periodically. Some type of continuing education should be involved to help the professional meet effectively whatever standards are established."

134. "Companies Broaden, Intensify Continuing Education Programs," Chemical and Engineering News, Vol. 46, No. 51, (Dec. 2, 1968), p. 38. "One of the most extensive company-sponsored programs for continuing education is carried out by Olin's chemicals groups at the Olin Research Center in New Haven, Conn....In Olin's program the company contributes an hour and the individual chemist contributes a half hour of his time."

135. Continuing Education for R & D Careers. 1969. ED 035 813.

136. Continuing Education in the Professions. 1969. ED 033 250. 225 item annotated bibliography on Engineering, Science, Medicine and Health, Education, Library Science, Law, Religion, Public Administration, the Military, Social Work, and general questions. From a summary in Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970): " A survey of medical care and

continuing education by G.E. Miller reveals that several studies on the effects of postgraduate education upon physicians' behavior indicate that there is little influence on subsequent practice."

137. Continuing Education in the Professions. 1967. ED 014 026. Annotated bibliography.

138. Coombs, Philip H. The World Educational Crisis: A Systems Analysis. New York: Oxford University Press, 1968. 241 pages. "There are numerous opportunities for an able and ambitious worker in the Soviet Union to advance himself by 'going back to school,' without heavy personal sacrifice. University professors, in turn, are obliged, and given time off, to keep pace with relevant new developments in their own fields, such as computer programming, in order to keep their research capabilities from growing obsolete. Other professionals, such as doctors, are obliged and enabled to keep pace with new knowledge and techniques in their respective fields."

139. Dill, William R., and others. "Strategies for Self-Education," Harvard Business Review, Vol. 43, No. 6, (Nov. 1965). From ERIC abstract (ED 015 376, but document not reproduced in microfiche): "70 young managers, facing the challenge of self-education, were questioned....Main pressures for self-education were to qualify for advancement.... Formal and self-education were seen as complementary to each other."

140. Frasher, Richard Dempsey. An Appraisal of the Status and Future of the Continuing Education (Non-credit) for Engineers in the U.S. 1969. ED 032 466. Masters Thesis in Adult Education done at Ohio State University including these quotes: Dr. John T. Rettalista, President of Illinois Institute of Technology - "But in our day the concept of continuing education has become mandatory for the man who is to remain abreast of his profession and his times." Julian C. Smith - "He must keep up; he must grow. Otherwise he won't be an engineer, and his employer will have to find someone to do the job he should be doing."

141. Houle, Cyril O. "The Lengthened Line of Education," Perspectives in Biology and Medicine, Vol. 11, No. 1, (Autumn 1967), reprinted in Jessup, see Item # 63 in this bibliography. "Every profession, it would seem, must be concerned with the education which occurs during the total life-span of its members....The root cause of the modern preoccupation with continuing education is that otherwise the very idea of professionalism cannot survive....The American Medical Association has for some time been engaged in a deep subteranean struggle on the subject of continuing education, a struggle whose violence is not apparent in the bland pronouncements by the AMA which occasionally appear....We shall simply have to hope that by precept and practice, by the positive force of education and the negative force of self-regulation, by open and free discussion and a full opportunity to scrutinize the principles which govern practice, each profession can elevate its dignity and maintain its integrity. The preservice educational program, after long effort, achieved intellectual strength and ethical force. Past success at one level may give us hope for future success at another."

142. Houle, Cyril O. "The Comparative Study of Continuing Professional Education, Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 3-12. "Some comparative studies might deal not with processes but with problems common to most or all of the professions. Let us consider a few examples....A closely allied question has to do with the use of compulsion as a spur to continuing education. Most professions issue lifetime licenses to practice, but this policy is now being called seriously into question. In some cases, participation in a learning opportunity is now required for renewal of a license, for continued membership in a specialty group, for the right to practice in a specific setting, or for the retention of some other valued privilege. How much good does such compulsory learning do? Does it really ever help either the practition-

er or his clients? If so, what are the best ways to use it and how can it be most skillfully applied?"

143. Koontz, Elizabeth D. A Consumer's Hopes and Dreams for Teacher Education: The Tenth Charles W. Hunt Lecture. 1969. ED 027 273. "From first hand experience, I can tell you unequivocally that much of the continuing or in-service education for teachers is an insult to them. Not only is much of it irrelevant, it is also imposed."

144. Lukasiewicz, J. "The Dynamics of Science and Engineering Education," Journal of Engineering Education, Vol. 61, No. 8, (1971), pp. 880-882. "It seems clear that the palliatives of prolonged formal studies and fast changing curricula will soon outlive their usefulness, and that nothing short of a complete integration of education with work over a man's productive lifespan will be adequate to cope with the growth of science and with educational obsolescence."

145. McGlothlin, W.J. Patterns of Professional Education. New York: G.P. Putnam's Sons, 1960. Houle in Item # 141 in this bibliography says: "McGlothlin, in his comparative study of architecture, business administration, engineering, law, medicine, nursing, psychology, social work, teacher education, and veterinary medicine found that all clearly recognized in their codes of ethics or elsewhere that education is a lifelong obligation."

146. McLeish, John A.B. "Continuing Professional Education in Canada," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 76-83. "The Anglican (Episcopalian) communion is developing particularly interesting techniques to help make continuing education part of the normal ongoing career experience of priests and other full-time church workers....Since the arrangement is a group one, the individual clergyman cannot otherwise 'buy into' the scheme. Its special and highly innovative feature is that it lays the obligation for continuing education upon all clergy and other full-time professional workers in a diocese, just as pension schemes are now accepted as essential and compulsory under group professional auspices....In the recent report of the Commission on the Healing Arts in Ontario, the commissioners note the perils of obsolescence in the health sciences, and take the position that medical, dental, nursing and other diplomas in this field should be renewed by some form of assessment every five years. The argument for the limited diploma in many professional fields is finding increasing support throughout the professions."

147. Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Dept. of Adult Education. A Response to the Draft Report of the Commission on Post-Secondary Education in Ontario. 1972. ED 062 629. "The Department strongly supports the principle of compulsory professional recertification (but notes) the grave dangers involved in tying professional certification or recertification to participation in a specific educational program."

148. Rauch, David B. "Open for Discussion," Adult Leadership, (March, 1972), pp. 325-326. "Within the professions adult education is rapidly becoming compulsory to maintain certification, licensing or membership in professional associations. And I'm sure the idea will spread....Perhaps it should also be compulsory for everyone to be also 'this year's adult.'...Every educational institution, public or private, should have an adult education arm. If we made this compulsory, we would at least be providing easy access for people."

149. Rebel, Karlheinz. "The Necessity of Further Education in the Professions and Home Study as a Means of Realization," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 66-75. Rebel is on the faculty of the University of Tubingen, West Germany. "The educational systems of modern, highly industrialized societies are, in the face of rapid, successive changes, caught in the dilemma of lagging way behind in that which is normally

expected of them and yet having too much demanded of them in the way of new tasks.... It would be a false assessment of the situation depicted here if one were to judge the challenge of these changes to the educational system merely from the point of view of negative results. On the contrary, behind all this unrest and discontent there appears to be a core of willingness on the part of more and more people to give learning greater importance in their lives. This corresponds to the ideas of anthropological pedagogics that only through learning does man become man in the true sense of the word; that the dependence on learning illustrates the first and probably most important restriction on man's freedom; that this restriction is intensified because learning is dependent on institutions that are, to a high degree, of a regulative nature (Theodor Wilhelm); and that learning cannot be limited to formal schooling since the processes of individualization, socialization, and culturalization are not completed by the time one steps into the adult world. The restriction on one's freedom is clearly accepted by man - above all, the adult - only if learning does justice to the existentially felt needs of the individual and of society, and if the learning processes are planned, carried out, and evaluated along the lines of a systematic economy of learning."

150. Renck, Richard and others. "Continuing Education - Current Policy and Practice in Industrial Research," Research Management, Vol. 13, No. 5, (Sept. 1970), pp. 351-366. Based on Chapter III of Continuing Education for R & D Careers (See Item # 135 in this bibliography). "The three key points in top laboratory management philosophy of continuing education are: management accepts the responsibility to provide at least some opportunities for scientists and engineers in the R & D work force; management expects R & D employees to take advantage of these and other opportunities to keep themselves up to date, particularly in their own fields of specialization; and, finally, management accepts only limited responsibility for motivating the individual. Managements which provide opportunities for continuing education believe that those who do not take advantage of them are not 'worth' attempting to salvage. The initiative is left to the individual."

151. Sneed, Joseph T. "Continuing Education in the Professions," Journal of Higher Education, Vol. 48, No. 3, (1972), pp. 223-238. "The fact is that professionals do not participate more extensively in formal continuing education because they do not feel the benefits therefrom exceed the costs....Certainty of income gains can only be achieved by providing that nonparticipation will result in an income loss. To a significant extent malpractice suits have increased the probability of an income loss when continuing medical education is avoided. Denial of hospital privileges, exclusion from the medical society, and loss of specialty certification or license as the price of avoiding continuing education also makes certain that most will participate. Medicine currently is experimenting with or discussing all these techniques. In addition, governmental pressure to participate in continuing education exists."

152. Thomas, Joseph J. "The Need for Continuing Education," Tappi, Vol. 52, No. 5, (May 1969), pp. 808-809. "It is not easy to go back to school. As we see our job here in TAPPI (Technical Association of the Pulp and Paper Industry), one of our tasks should be to make it easy to go back to school, to stay educated, to get up to date, to know what is going on, and to find out what is new in the scientific world."

PART IV: COMPULSORY ADULT EDUCATION IN THE HEALTH PROFESSIONS

(See also Items # 1, 3, 132, 136, 137, 138, 141, 145, 146, 151 in this bibliography.)

153. AMA Council on Health Manpower. "Continuing Competence of Physicians," Journal of American Medical Association, Vol. 217, No. 11, (Sept. 13, 1971), pp. 1537-1541. "The purpose of the present report is twofold: (1) to examine in detail the methods through which physicians are currently afforded the opportunity to maintain and improve their clinical competence, and, further, to examine their potentials and areas for improvement; (2) to discuss more fully the alternative mechanisms for ensuring continued physician participation in such methods and to recommend those which should receive further emphasis... There is relatively little consensus on the degree to which participation in continuing education today is conducive to improved clinical ability, or on the degree to which performance on any examination truly measures such ability."

154. "American Medical Association and Continuing Education," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol, 210, (Nov. 24, 1969), p. 1586. Editorial. "The leadership of the AMA, state medical societies and specialty societies in promoting continuing medical education seems particularly appropriate and urgent at this time, lest licensing agencies, government programs, thrid-party payers or others outside the profession attempt to assure quality of physicians' services in ways that would be less effective and less acceptable to patients and physicians alike."

155. "A.N.A. Task Force to Study Continuing Education," American Journal of Nursing, Vol. 71, (August 1971), pp. 1513+? The task force will study the question of including continuing education as a requirement for license renewal.

156. Annotated Bibliography on Inservice Training for Key Professionals in Community Mental Health. 1969. ED 037 355.

157. "Another State Tells Pharmacists 'Learn or Else, '"Drug Topics; 116:14 (July 3, 1972), p. 4. (from Vottero literature review) New Jersey law.

158. Associated Press, "Physician Relicensing Advised by U.S. Panel," Dayton (Ohio Daily News, (Dec. 18, 1972), p. 7. 'Washington: (AP) - A federal malpractice commission has urged periodic relicensing of all doctors based on continued medical education, periodic re-examinations for specialists and tougher state procedures for disciplining incompetents. The 21-member commission, named by Secretary of HEW Elliot Richardson in August, 1971, ended 16 months of study with a three-day session concluding Sunday. The group headed by Pittsburgh lawyer Wendell G. Freeland, said state licensing boards should include lay members, and their disciplinary hearings should be open to the public. The commission concluded that the chief cause of a growing number of medical malpractice suits is injury to patients - not, as some doctors say, fee-seeking lawyers...The commission accepted for inclusion in its final report a partial dissent by Dr. Charles A. Hoffman, president of the American Medical Association and a commission member. Hoffman saw 'the zealous performance' of lawyers as the root cause for the

increasing number and cost of malpractice claims. If doctors have to be re-examined or relicensed, he maintained, the same should be true for lawyers and other professionals."

159. Baldwin's Ohio Revised Code and Rules Service: 1971 Laws Issue. (From Vottero literature review). Law making continuing education mandatory for pharmacists in Ohio.

160. Boissoneau, Robert. "Ph.D. General Examination," 1972. See below for address. "A basic question here and one that threads through many avenues of today's questions is: Is each individual responsible for his learning or does some authority figure make educational decisions for that person?...I believe there are sincere people, perhaps naive, who feel that mandatory adult education laws will upgrade their field, increase knowledge and skills of their members and bring more prestige and status to themselves and others as a result...My personal position is in opposition to a mandatory law for adult education. I feel that I would always be opposed to infringement into the personal life segment of adult education....On the other hand, in occupational life I am opposed to a mandatory law but with important differences. I could conceive of circumstances in which I would feel compelled to support a mandatory position but they are not very realistic."

161. Boissoneau, Robert. The Effects of Voluntary and Mandatory Continuing Education upon Public Policy as Perceived by Hospital Administrators. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation Proposal, Ohio State University, College of Education, August 14, 1972. A revised version of this proposal is now being prepared. The author is Assistant Professor, University of Missouri-Columbia, School of Medicine, M-537 Medical Sciences, Columbia, Mo. 65201. A significant number of the references in the health professions area in this bibliography were uncovered by Boissoneau.

162. Brown, Clement R. and Henry S. Uhl. "Mandatory Continuing Education: Sense or Nonsense?" Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 213, No. 10, (Sept. 7, 1970), pp. 1660-1668. "It is the central thesis of this essay that mandatory attendance at current 'cure-all' programs of continuing medical education for undefined ills would be a disaster and would frustrate the adventurous efforts of an increasing number of educators to create innovative approaches to education for the practicing physician."

163. Buerki, Robert A. "Philosophy Behind Requiring Continuing Education for Relicensure as a Pharmacist in Ohio," undated 7 page typescript. Buerki is Director, Pharmacy Extension Service, The Ohio State University College of Pharmacy. "Monies to support such a program could be obtained from a portion of pharmacists' license renewal fees, from proceeds from renting or selling continuing education materials, from proceeds from continuing education conferences or seminars, state or federal grants, or from any combination of the above."

164. Carmichael, Hugh T. "Self-Assessment Tests: The Psychiatric Knowledge and Skills Self-Assessment Program," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 213, No. 10 (Sept. 7, 1970), pp. 1656-1657. "The President's Commission on Health Manpower has recommended relicensure to compel physicans to keep up with new knowledge...The issue of voluntary mandatory relicensure, recertification or compulsory taking of continuing education courses has now been joined. It has been discussed frequently in the meetings held in conjunction with this 66th annual Congress on Medical Education. The attitude and position of the

American Psychiatric Association on this question is that we have an antipathy to compulsory measures, which no doubt some of you share, and we hope to forestall their imposition by the success of our program in motivating our members to remedy the serious gaps in knowledge and skills disclosed by our Psychiatric Knowledge and Skills Self-Assessment program by continuing their own self education...Continuing education should be continuing self-education not continuing instruction. The content model aids and abets passivity and dependence on teachers. The process model fosters self-reliance and self-learning."

165. Carmichael, Hugh T., S. Mouchly Small and Peter F. Regan. Prospects and Proposals: Lifetime Learning for Psychiatrists. Washington, D.C.: American Psychiatric Association, 1972. Says the March 15, 1972 issue of Psychiatric News: "A book by the members of the advisory group and the director of APA's Office of Continuing Education of Psychiatrists released this month urges an immediate and strenuous course of action by psychiatrists to develop a national continuing education program for members of the specialty of psychiatry and thus forestall 'the apparent evolution by external forces which will certainly bring about some form of compulsory continuing education and assessment...' if psychiatry does not act."

166. "Continuing Education: Option or Obligation," Journal of the Tennessee Medical Association, (Dec. 1968), pp. 1241-1245. Footnote states that this is a reprint from Hospital Practice, Oct., 1968 "Dr. William N. Hubbard, Jr., dean of the University of Michigan Medical School...told the Federation of State Medical Boards last year, 'Reexaminations of practicing physicians could give artifical reassurance. Passing an essentially factual examination means only that the raw materials for rational professional practice are present. It does not measure the quality or the actual value of the physicians efforts.'"

167. "Continuing Education Required for License," Dental Survey, Vol. 45, (July 1969), pp. 40+? Report of survey of dentists asking: "Should State Boards require dentists to take a prescribed number of post-graduate courses or attend a specified number of dental meetings during a five year period in order to be relicensed?" 48% said yes, 52% said no.

168. Cooper, John A.D. "Education for the Health Professions in the Soviet Union," Journal of Medical Education, Vol. 46, No. 5, (May 1971), pp. 412+. "Fifty-six thousand physicians took advanced training in 1969. It is not obligatory by law for them to return for this training but the advantages of increased salary and a more attractive position after training attracts them to the courses."

169. Dalton, John E. "What Is the Position of the American Association of Dental Examiners on Continuing Education as a Requirement for Relicensure?" Journal of the American College of Dentists, Vol. 36, (July 1969), pp. 186+?

170. Debus, John J. "Address of the Chairman, N.A.B.P. District No. 2," Proceedings, Joint Meeting of Boards and Colleges, District No. 2. 1941. (From Vottero literature review). The concept of requiring continuing education credits for relicensure (of pharmacists) was suggested in 1941.

171. Dimond, E. Grey. "National Resources for Continuing Medical Education," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 206, No. 3, (Oct. 14, 1968), pp. 617-162. "The most elaborate network of teaching machines, individual

physician plug-in to the Medical Literature Analysis and Retrieval System (MEDLARS), direct dial for delightful drug dangers, quick clues from classy consultants in color, and 'please pass the examination or pay the price' intimidation still leave out the key human catalyst. The concept must incorporate many parts, and this includes the wide distribution of students in community hospitals who will act as living stimuli and whose very presence provokes from the physician a reflex need for information. How can we gather enough students for this role of stimulator? And incidentally, where can we gain a new source of health manpower and an improved, increased roster of medical school applicants? Have you considered premedical education?...Here would seem to be the ultimate stimulus which would cause the physician to turn towards his regional and national medical education program. By giving the community hospital staff a primary responsible teaching role and requiring the regional community hospital premedical program to measure up to an externally developed examination, an effective stimulus, not unkind or malevolent, is offered."

172. Dozier, Terry. "Mandatory Continuing Education - A Reality," California Pharmacist, 19:12 (Dec. 1971), pp. 24-27. (From Vottero literature review).

173. Dryer, Bernard V. "Lifetime Learning for Physicians," The Journal of Medical Education, Vol. 37, (June 1962). "The Dryer Report" There is also a Foreward by Ward Darley which questions man's ability to handle the new medical knowledge produced since World War II. From an ERIC abstract (ED 021 173, document not reproduced in ERIC): "Assumes that education is most beneficial when separated from regulation."

174. Eichorst, Thomas E. "Journal State Legal-Legislative Report," Journal of the American Optometric Association, (April 1972), p. 374. "Optometry is the leader among the professions in requiring continuing education for relicensures. Twenty-one states now have such a requirement: 16 by state law and 5 by state board rule."

175. Eisele, C. Wesley. "The Medical Audit in Continuing Education," Journal of Medical Education, Vol. 44, No. 4, (April 1969), pp 263-265. "One advantage of the community hospital site, or one disadvantage depending upon the viewpoint, is that if the (continuing medical education) lecture proves to be dull, the so called student can escape more readily via the telephone call, either genuine or prearranged...The medical audit satisfies the special educational needs of the practicing physician in 7 ways:...3. All members of the staff are involved. A reluctant physician may shun postgraduate courses, and he may avoid scientific meetings in his own hospital and at his county medical society. But he will be hard put to escape the impact of the medical audit when it involves his own patients."

176. "File of Miscellaneous Documents in John Ohliger's Office on Mandatory Continuing Education for Pharmacists." Various materials mainly dealing with Ohio situation.

177. "Florida Puts Mandatory Continuing Education Into New Reciprocity Law," American Druggist, 156:6 (Sept. 11, 1967), p. 31. (From Vottero literature review)

178. Flynn, Richard O. "Periodic Relicensure?" Arizona Medicine, (date? reference obtained from Boissoneau), p. 584. "The Board of Medical Examiners has

already started to consider some method of periodic relicensure and this gives impetus to the (Arizona Medical) Association coming up with their own ideas. The problem was that no one had any good method of determining competency. The method used by the Academy of General Practice the last fifteen years, and now being used in Oregon, is one of counting hours of postgraduate education. The (Arma) House of Delegates felt that there are many doctors who are able to keep up by reading, listening to tapes, joining journal clubs, going to hospital meetings, and don't need formal programs. Other doctors have been known to sign in for formal programs and promptly head for the golf course where they busily count hours."

179. Fox, Leon P. "Continuing Education for the Specialist," California Medicine, Vol. 109, No. 3, (Sept. 1968), pp. 252-255. "It seems obvious that if we as a profession do not develop a working mechanism (for maintaining competence) and activate it promptly, then the state will surely do so in an arbitrary manner."

180. Gibbs, Gertrude E. "Will Continuing Education Be Required for License Renewal?" American Journal of Nursing, Vol. 71, No. 11, (Nov. 1971), pp 2175-2179. Subtitle: "Maybe, but even if it is not tied to licensure, continuing education is recognized as a professional necessity today, says this nurse who describes breifly what other professions are doing about it."

181. Hardyment, A.F. "Peer-group Analysis - a Form of Medical Audit: Its Role in Continuing Medical Education," C.M.A. Journal, Vol. 104, (June 19, 1971), pp. 1104-1106. "Re-licensure has been mentioned, and even recommended by politicians and labor-union spokesmen, but it is generally viewed with alarm by the medical profession."

182. Hickam, John B. "Periodic Recertification," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 213, (Sept. 7, 1970), pp 1658+?

183. H.L.H. "Editorial: Continuing Education and Relicense: Physician Opinion," Northwest Medicine, (June, 1969), pp. 532-533. Survey of physicians in Oregon, Washington, & Idaho on topic. Eight questions plus comments like these from respondents: "Government at state and federal levels will get into the act - merely for the notoriety it gains the politicians. Professional competence can't be legislated any better than public morals." "As a result of many years of teaching medical students and residents, I feel it is impossible to teach somebody something he doesn't want to know. Therefore, compulsory courses seem likely to fail in their objective." "Government pressure is high already for continued, mandatory education." "Why don't they work on easing our liability, our work, and our worries so we can keep up!" "If it comes, I quit."

184. Hozid, Joseph L. "Role of Continuing Education in Dental Obsolescence," Journal of the American Dental Association, Vol. 78, No. 6, (June 1969), pp. 1299-1303. "Continuing education is imperative, but in unorganized 'refresher course' form it will not stem the tide of obsolescence. A systematic, intergrated approach by professional schools and organizations and appropriate governmental agencies is called for....I am saying that the usual continuing education programs are themselves obsolete, and that this obsolescence is a significant causal factor supporting practitioner obsolescence."

185. Kampmeier, R. H. "Editorial: Motivation Toward Continuing Education," Journal of the Tennessee Medical Association, (Feb. 1969), pp. 144-145. "Motivation may be

stimulated by desire to receive approbation of one's peers....This may contain an element of coercion (by his peers) as the need to fulfill requirements for membership in the American Academy of General Practice, for example....Motivation may be the result of outright coercion - the poorest and most unsatisfactory form of motivation as brought out in the Dryer Report. Yet it is the possible coercion in the threat of some move toward relicensure or recertification which lends an impetus to the current flury of activity in the field of continuing education....Government coercion is possible. Twelve states require evidence of continuing education in annual recertification of osteopathic physicians. New York state links the payment of doctors for Medicaid to evidence that he has taken part in continued education unless he is a member of the American Academy of General Practice or eligible for Board certification."

186. "Kansas Is First State to Make Continuing Education Mandatory," Drug Topics, 111:11 (May 29, 1967). (From Vottero literature review). For pharmacists.

187. Kaye, Ronald L. "California Medical Association's Certificate in Continuing Medical Education," California Medicine, Vol. 112, No. 2, (Feb. 1970), pp. 74-75. "It is anticipated that such a (certificate) program will offer a reasonable alternative to the pressure of current legislative proposals which are now pending concerning periodic re-licensing of physicians."

188. Kennedy, Edward M. "Health Security for America," Congressional Record, 92nd Congress, (January 25, 1971(, p. 8+? Senator Kennedy's bill would charge the Health Security Board with establishing requirements for continuing education of health personnel.

189. Kennedy, Edward M. In Critical Condition. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1972 Notes that critics of continued voluntary continuing medical education are skeptical about people reaching required objectives on their own volition and that people must have incentives in order to reach goals.

190. Kunkel, Frank. "Mandatory Continuing Education," 6 page typescript, publication and date unknown, but attached to a 1971 memo from the OSPA Continuing Education Committee with a note that Kunkel is the Executive Secretary, Ohio Board of Pharmacy. "Mandatory continuing education appears to be our next exercise to move the profession of pharmacy toward our ideal of recognition by society and our medical allies, as the equal of any....I, personally, can take it or leave it. In one respect, I resent the Ohio General Assembly, made up almost exclusively of legislators having no familiarity with pharmacy, telling me what to do to remain a pharmacist in good standing. I realize that this concept is not its idea and it is simply the medium for providing the mandatory effect, but I still can be a good pharmacist without the intrusion of government into my professional affairs. Also, I have been a pharmacist and known many other pharmacists long enough to realize that no action by our legislature, short of capital punishment, can remove what few incompetents and malefactors we have from our ranks. A relatively few hours of annual mandatory continuing education will have no significant effect in changing them from what they are to what the idealist would like them to be. Conversely, the good professional pharmacists are and have been exceeding the minimal requirements of MCE all along and because they want to, which is a much better motivation than a statute. If pharmacy simply wishes to window dress the profession for whatever salutary effect it may have on other medical or health practitioners and the public in general, I don't object. Also, if local or state pharmaceutical associations wish to use MCE to promote membership and attendance at their

meetings, I heartily endorse the proposition. But if, on the other hand, the profession is sincere in wanting to raise its standards in the interest of public health and welfare, let's go about it in a logical and rational manner."

191. Lawrence, G. Dwaine. "Voluntary or Compulsory...Continuing Education," Journal of the American Pharmaceutical Association, Vol. 9 No. 10, (1969), pp. 510-512. "I do not believe that continuing education should be compulsory for relicensure! I even question that licensure should be required."

192. Levi, Edward H. and others. Symposium: Professional Education in the Contemporary University. 1971. ED 055 550. "Each physician must remain always a member of the Medical college....With this there is a suggestion that the medical profession require for continued certification a specified number of hours devoted to continuing education each year."

193. Lewis, Charles E. and Ruth S. Hassanein. "Continuing Medical Education - An Epidemiologic Evaluation," New England Journal of Medicine, Vol. 282, No. 5 (Jan. 29, 1970), pp. 254-259. "Maternal and perinatal death rates in various areas were unrelated to hours of continuing education in obstetrics and pediatrics taken by local p ysicians. Similarly, high regional rates for certain operative procedures were not associated with increased use of appropriate postgraduate education."

194. Malamed, Emanuel H. "Continuing Education and Renewal of the Dental License: a Conference," Journal of American Dental Association, Vol. 80, (Feb. 1970), pp. 331-334. "Arguments for and against compulsory continuing education as a requirement for renewal of the dental license were heard and discu sed at a conference sponsored by the council on dental health of the Philadelphia County Dental Society. The majority of respondents to a questionnaire circulated at the conference favored compulsory continuing education and believed that organized dentistry on the constituent level should be responsible for the continuing education of the dental practitioner."

195. Marrocco, Mafalda C. "No Psychiatrists Among Eleven Physicians Expelled in Oregon," Psychiatric News, (March 15, 1972), p. 3. "Physicians in Oregon were jolted in January when 11 of their colleagues were expelled from the state medical association for failing to meet continuing education requirements that were imposed on them two years ago....When the Oregon Medical Association in January 1970 was the first state medical society to impose on their members mandatory requirements for continuing education, the action met with mixed response....The response among psychiatrists to the new continuing education requirements has been favorable, according to Dr. Bray, of the Oregon District Branch (of the American Psychiatric Association), who chaired the committee that developed the requirements for psychiatrists. 'Some responded negatively at first, saying that they did not approve of using a negative goal as a way of modifying behavior,' he said."

196. McCallum, Charles A. "What is the Attitude of the American Association of Dental Schools on Continuing Education as a Requirement for Re-Licensure," The Journal of the American College of Dentists, Vol. 36, (July 1969), pp. 189+?

197. McHenry, Ruth, ed. Ends and Means: The National Conference on Continuing Education in Nursing, 1970, Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Publications in Continuing Education, 1971. "The forward thrust of health sciences is creating a condition that does obligate the health professional to assume more personal responsibility for continuous maintenance of competence. The (National Commission for the Study of Nursing and Nursing Education) study showed that there is evidence of an increasing climate among many professions for imposing a legally defined obligation on the individual. California, in fact, has introducted legislation to establish evidenceof formal participation in continuing education as a condition of license renewal. For this reason, the Commission recommended that: All state licensure laws for nursing be revised to require periodic review of the individual's qualifications for practice as a condition for license renewal. The Commission saw demonstration of continuing study as the conventional and appropriate means for a legal requirement to maintain competence."

198. Moxley, John H. "Legislation and Social Pressures for Continuing Education," Journal of the American College of Dentists, Vol. 36, (July 1969), pp. 164+?

199. Mueller, C. Barber. "Continuing Assessment of Medical Performance," New England Journal of Medicine, (June 17, 1971), pp. 1378-1380. "Since peer review has consistently been inadequate to guarantee high standards of physician performance by exclusion of the inadequate or undesirable, such recertification examinations will probably require objective outside (lay) examiners acquainted with medical practices, even though unacquainted with specific medical knowledge."

200. Pace, William G."Undated form letter from Director, Center for Continuing Medical Education, Ohio State University." "Recently you may have participated in an Opinion Study conducted by the Ohio State Medical Association. Over 30% of the responding physicians felt that participation in a continuing medical education program should be a requirement for maintenance of a license to practice medicine in Ohio."

201. Pellegrino, Edmund D. "Continuing Education in the Health Professions," American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, Vol. 33, No. 5, (1969), pp. 712-720. "After the degree is conferred, continuing education is society's only real guarantee of the optimal quality of health care....Professional bodies in the health field should...make continuing education a condition for continued membership.... Continuing education will sooner or later become a legal requirement for continued practice."

202. Pennington, Merle. "Continuing Education as a Requirement for Medical Society Membership," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 213, (Sept. 7, 1970), pp 1658-1660. Believes that physicians would be more amendable to a connection between continuing education and relicensure if a plan were to be originated and administrated by physicians.

203. Petit, Donald W. "State Medical Association's Role in the Continuing Education of the Practicing Physician," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 208, No. 10 (June 9, 1969), pp. 1835-1838. "In its exploration of motivation the conference charged the CMA (California Medical Association) with the task of considering the desirability of recertification of physicians to continue their medical education."

204. Petit, Donald W. "The Physician Recognition Award," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 213, (Sept. 7, 1970), pp. 1668-1670. "The impact of an award of this sort will be felt in many areas. The practicing physician sees it as yet another obligation on his time, and, therefore, a lessening of the time he can give to direct patient care....There must be a way developed to validate the most used and perhaps the most valuable techniques of continuing education for physicians, namely, self-instruction from journals, other colleagues, video and sound tapes, and the daily care of the sick patient. The validation of such activities is necessary to prevent its submergence under the weight of courses in more formalized activities."

205. Proceedings of the Second National Conference of State Medical Association Representatives on Continuing Medical Education. 1970. ED 060 447. One question discussed was: "Should we make membership in organized medicine contingent on documented participation in continuing education?"

206. "Pursuit of Excellence - Through Continuing Education," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 210, (Nov. 24, 1969), pp. 1585+? Notes that the American Academy of Family Practice (formerly American Academy of General Practice) has requred members to complete continuing education activities since its founding in 1948.

207. "Registered Dietitian or R.D.," American Dietetic Association Courier, (June 1969), pp. 1-2+? Continuing Education requirement for the "RD."

208. "Relicensure, Physician Competence, and Continuing Medical Education," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. 217, No. 5, (Aug. 2, 1971), pp. 688-689. Unsigned Editorial. "In carrying out their responsibilities, state licensing agencies are faced with the problems of how physician competence and performance are defined and measured, what standards should be used, and how they should be applied. To the public and their elected representatives, the answer to these problems might seem to be some kind of standardized examination that would be kept up-to-date and which every physician must pass in order to be relicensed. It has been difficult, if not impossible, for state licensing agencies to give the public an adequate understanding of why this procedure will not accomplish the objectives of maintaining the quality of physician services and protecting public health. It is gratifying to note that there are now important trends in the field of continuing medical education that seem to offer state licensing authorities better ways to accomplish their objectives. These trends include: 1. The support of the AMA House of Delegates for such ideas as periodic recertification by specialty boards, and documentation of continuing medical education activities as a condition for continued membership in state medical associations. ...11. Serious consideration by state medical associations for making continuing medical education a condition of membership, and the adoption of such a policy by state medical associations in Oregon, Pennsylvania, Arizona, and Ohio. 12. The outstanding program of the American Academy of Family Physicians as the only specialty organization requiring continuing medical education as a condition of membership. 13. The standard of the Joint Commission on Accreditation of Hospitals, which states in part that 'the medical staff shall provide a continuing program of professional education, and give evidence of participation in such a program.'"

209. Revised Tentative Proposal for Professional Registration. Chicago: American Dietetic Association, August 30, 1968.

210. Rising, Jesse D. ed. Proceedings of the Conference on Evaluation in Continuing Medical Education. 1970. ED 051 434. "People are considering recertification

and relicensure, and the federal government may be getting into this....We may be perpetrating a gigantic fraud on the American public, the American doctor and everyone concerned....Everytime we measure something in a reasonable kind of way regarding continuing education we find it has no effect at all."

211. Robertson, William O. and Charles W. Dohner. Study of Continuing Medical Education for the Purpose of Establishing a Demonstration Center for Continuing Education. 1970. ED 052 323. "In modern society lifelong learning by the physician is essential."

212. Schwartz, Michael A. "Panel: Funding Continuing Education Programs," American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, Vol. 33, No. 5, (1969), pp. 786-788. "An additional point of merit for this proposal is that participation by practitioners in continuing education should be markedly increased because the practitioner would gain an increased sense of involvement, improved programs should result and, of course, we all like to 'get our money's worth' from any venture. Thus, the question of whether or not continuing education should be mandatory for licensure would become purely academic."

213. Selden, William K. "The Dilemmas of Credentialing: SASHEP Looks at Forces Affecting Health Care," Journal of the American Dietetic Association, Vol. 61, No. 1, (July 1972), pp. 22-25. "Concurrent with and to a large extent resulting from the growth in population, the advances in science and technology, the improvements in communication and transportation, the industrialization of society, and the independence and nationalization of peoples on all continents - the world is undergoing a politico-economic revolution in which few elements of society are unaffected. The current world-wide revolution involves a struggle among contending groups for economic and political power, a spreading spirit of equality, and a reassessment of the structure and operation of government, as well as a reassessment of the philosophical concepts on which civil political structure has been based. Among the social benefits, for which groups are contending in the U.S., is a more equitable provision of health care....With greater involvement in and increasing financing of health care by government, the public accountability looms as an issue of broad and fundamental import which can be resolved only within the context of the currently evolving socio-political transformations. Accreditation, certification, licensure, and registration were fashioned as part of the mechanism of social control of health professional personnel to meet the socio-political needs of an earlier period. At that time, public accountability was accepted slowly and unevenly as being vital to the welfare of society. Only recently has it been recognized to be as important for the entire field of health care as it is, for example, for the entire sphere of economic activity."

214. Shalinsky, Joe, and others. "Report of the Committee on Continuing Education of the National Association of Boards of Pharmacy," 14 page typescript of meeting April 14-15, 1972. "Continuing Education is upon us. It is the 'in thing.' It may not be 'your bag' today, but sooner or later, it will surround you - You can't hide from it --- Like the inebriated gentleman who pleaded to the desk sergeant --- 'Please lock me up - I just hit my wife on the head with a bottle.' 'Did you kill her?' demanded the officer. 'Don't think so - that's why I want to be locked up.' ...Compulsory continuing education for pharmacy relicensure is no longer idle talk but a fast moving reality. NABP must take a positive stand or it will be left standing by stripped of its potential to participate in this formative era in the evaluation of pharmacy practice. A little meek man had just been arrested for speeding 60 miles an hour through the residential section. 'What's your alibi?' asked the judge. --- and the little meek man said --- 'I have just heard, your Honor, that the ladies of my wife's church were having a rummage sale,

and I was hurrying home to save my other pair of pants.' NABP needs to hurry - NABP needs to act. NABP needs to ENDORSE compulsory Continuing Education."

215. Sodeman, William A. "Continuing Education: The Interrelated Role of the Community Hospital, the Professional Society and the Medical School," Chest, Vol. 56, No. 3, (Sept. 1969), pp. 186-192. "Documentation of the impact of the 'explosion' in scientific knowledge on the physician and his practice is no longer necessary. ...Interest is high in discussions on recertification and revalidation for continued membership in specialty groups and societies...While the advantages or disadvantages of required versus voluntary technics to stimulate interest in continuing education are not part of the present discussion, such efforts do point out our critical needs to organize this phase of medical education more adequately. Of all phases of medical education it (continuing education) is the most difficult, disorganized, and unstructured. In the light of the definition of a curriculum, for most practitioners the term does not fit."

216. Stein, Justin J. "Re-Examination and Re-Certification of Physicians," California Medicine, Vol. 109, No. 2, (Aug. 1968), pp. 175-177. "There is a distinct possibility,...unless sufficient voluntary efforts for continuing medical education are made by the practicing physician and by certifying and specialty organizations, governmental agencies will attempt to specify certain requirements which must be met for continued licensure."

217. Sullens, Reginald H. "Dental Licensure and Continuing Education," (Journal & Date ? reference from Boissoneau), pp. 14-17. Background on the proposed presentation of a Bylaw to the American Dental Association House of Delegates requiring continuing education for membership in constituent groups.

218. "Symposium on Continuing Education in Dentistry," British Dental Journal, Vol. 132, No. 7, (April 4, 1972), pp. 273-279+? Contains "suggestions for securing compulsory training in the immediate postgraduate period."

219. Tancredi, Laurence R. and John Woods, "The Social Control of Medical Practice," The Milbank Memorial Fund Quarterly, Vol. 50, (Jan. 1972), pp. 104+?

220. Time, "Capsules," (Feb. 28, 1972), p. 54. "All too many doctors fail to keep up with new medical developments, and to remedy this, authorities in some states are taking action. The Oregon Medical Association (2,400 members) was the first to make continued training a condition of membership....As a result of this requirement, 17 members have recently resigned or been expelled, losing various benefits, though not the right to practice. A New Mexico law to take effect in November will jeopardize even that, requiring doctors to average 40 hours educationally annually or lose their licenses."

221. "Urges Pharmacy 'Refreshers' Be Made Compulsory," Drug Topics, 85:12, (March 24, 1941), pp. 2 & 12. (from Vottero literature review) Refers to Debus speech.

222. Vollan, D.D. Postgraduate Medical Education in the United States. Chicago: American Medical Association, 1955. Report of a Survey by the Council on Medical Education and Hospitals.

223. Vottero, Louis D. Review of the Literature on Mandatory Adult Education for Pharmacists. Dec. 1972. Two typed pages with 10 references. Get from John Ohliger. "Since 1967, five states - Kansas, Florida, California, Ohio, and New Jersey - have adopted mandatory continuing education statutes affecting more than 22 % of the pharmacists in the U.S."

224. Wechsler, Henry and others. "Continuing Education and New England Dentists: A Questionnaire Survey," Journal of the American Dental Association, Vol. 78, No. 3, (march 1969), pp. 573-?. Seems to assume that "a lifetime of learning" and continuing education are synonymous.

225. "What's New in Professional Pharmacy: Compulsory Refreshers," American Druggist, 103:5, (May, 1941), p. 34. (From Vottero literature review), refers to Debus speech (see Item # 170 in this bibliography).

226. White, Allen I. "How Libraries Can Contribute to the Growing Need in the Health Science Field for Continuing Education," American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, Vol. 33, No. 5, (1969), pp. 850-853. "Since this upsurge of interest in continuing education programs coincides with expressions of concerns from legislators and people in government agencies over the maintenance of professional competencies and with the enactment of legislation requiring participation in continuing education programs, one might conclude that pressures from outside the professions have been very important stimulants in this development."

227. White, Allen I. "Report of the Special Tripartite Committee on Continuing Education," American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, Vol. 35, (August 1971), pp. 467-471. "The power to institute and administer compulsory continuing education lies within the states, and that for pharmacy, the state boards of pharmacy are the only agencies to which power for enforcing such a requirement may be delegated at this time....The Committee recommends that acceptable programs be defined so as to include only those courses which involve student-teacher communication....This recommendation is not intended to imply that informal and self-study programs are without value. It is proposed as a means of validating the quantification necessary in a regulation....Ruled out as acceptable programs would be such things as audio tapes and journal reading."

228. White, Allen I. and others. "(Final) Report of the Tripartite Committee on Continuing Education," undated 16 page typescript, but apparently later than the report by White in Item #227 in this bibliography. "Four states, Florida (1967), Kansas (1967), California (1971), and Ohio (1971), now have statutes that require pharmacists to participate in continuing education programs in order to be eligible for relicensure....The committee...recognizes also that it would be most helpful to have a quantification system for continuing education study as universally applicable and understood as is the college and university credit system for formal education programs. Such a system for universal application was recommended in 1969 by P.J. Grogran in his report of the National Task Force on the Uniform System of Measurement for Noncredit Continuing Education. That report recommends that sponsors of continuing education opportunities refer to their offerings in terms of 'continuing education units' (C.E.U.) and defines a unit '...as ten hours of participation in an organized continuing education experience under responsible sponsorship and qualified instruction or direction'."

229. Williamson, John W., and others. "Continuing Education and Patient Care Research," Journal of the American Medical Association, Vol. CCI, (Sept. 18, 1967). According to a summary in "Continuing Education for the Professions in the U.S.," by LeRoy W. Nattress, Jr., Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970): "Williamson, in his study of the management of urinary tract infection in a community hospital in the Midwest, found that 70 % of those requiring treatment did not receive it and 30 % of those who did receive treatment did not require it. To improve this situation,

the medical staff had several meetings with the faculty from a school of medicine in related continuing education programs. These proved ineffective."

230. World Health Organization. "Continuing Medical Education in the USSR," W.H.O. Chronicle, Vol. 24, No. 5, (1970), pp. 216-218. "Further medical education is given to every health worker and is more or less obligatory."

231. Zeidlits, Leonid. "The Professional Growth of Physicians in the Soviet Union," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 4, (1970), pp. 16-19. "In the Soviet Union, the professional growth of physicians is achieved by the continuation of medical training. On graduating from a medical college, the physician must constantly improve his professional skills; he must make all possible use of the latest achievements in medical theory and practice in his everyday work. But the physician's professional growth must in no way be alienated from his basic primary specialization."

ERIC Clearinghouse

AUG 23 1973

on Adult Education